

PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

GRAFFITI ABATEMENT SERVICES / OP91160-20028370 and OP91160-20008370

1.	Contract Number: OP91160-20028370 (Region 1) OP91160-20008370 (Regions 2 & 3)	
2.	Recommended Vendor: BriteWorks, Inc. (Region 1) Bread & Water Landscape, LLC (Regions 2 & 3)	
3.	Type of Procurement (check one): <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order	
4.	Procurement Dates:	
	A. Issued: October 13, 2023	
	B. Advertised/Publicized: October 13, 2023	
	C. Pre-Proposal Conference: October 19, 2023	
	D. Proposals Due: November 14, 2023	
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: May 14, 2024	
	F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics: November 16, 2023	
	G. Protest Period End Date: June 24, 2024	
5.	Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded: 25	Bids/Proposals Received: 4 (Region 1) 4 (Region 2) 6 (Region 3)
6.	Contract Administrator: Marc Margoni	Telephone Number: 213-922-1304
7.	Project Manager: Shaunt Avanesian	Telephone Number: 213-922-5931

A. Procurement Background

This Board action is to approve the award of Contract No. OP91160-20028370 (Region 1) to BriteWorks, Inc. and Contract No. OP91160-20008370 (Regions 2 and 3) to Bread & Water Landscape, LLC to provide graffiti abatement services throughout Metro bus and rail facilities, active and inactive rights of way (IROW), Metro Park & Ride (P&R) Lots and Caltrans P&R Lots. Board approval of contact awards is subject to the resolution of any properly submitted protest(s), if any.

The Request for Proposals (RFP) was originally issued on September 27, 2022, as a Small Business Prime Set-Aside. Metro received 12 proposals for regions 1 and 2 combined. However, the solicitation was canceled to expand SBE Prime participation and to limit contract awards to a maximum of two regions per proposer.

Prior to the re-issuance of the solicitation, Metro conducted two Metro Connect Industry Forum Outreach events on August 23, 2023, and August 31, 2023, which were attended by 129 individuals representing small and medium-sized firms. During the outreach events, staff provided an overview detailing the SBE Program policies for competitively negotiated procurements. The event also informed the small business community of the upcoming contracting opportunity to increase and promote small business participation.

On October 13, 2023, RFP No. OP91160-2 was issued as a competitive procurement in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is a firm-fixed unit rate. The RFP was issued as a Small Business Prime Set-Aside.

Graffiti abatement services are among the services that are part of Metro's agency-wide strategy to provide partnering opportunities to community-based organizations (CBOs). The RFP encouraged potential proposers to work with CBOs that have direct experience, relationships, and expertise in the geographical locations where graffiti abatement services shall be performed.

Three amendments were issued for this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on October 23, 2023, provided the Prevailing Wage Information sheet relevant to the RFP;
- Amendment No. 2, issued on November 6, 2023, clarified the RFP proposal due date and the relevant experience to be considered in evaluating proposers' past performance.
- Amendment No. 3, issued on November 9, 2023, clarified changes to the evaluation criteria provided in Amendment No. 2.

A virtual pre-proposal conference was held on October 19, 2023, with eight participants in attendance representing seven firms. There were no questions received prior to the proposal due date.

On November 14, 2023, Metro received a total of 14 proposals listed below in alphabetical order by region:

Region 1

1. Bread & Water Landscape, LLC
2. BriteWorks, Inc.
3. Strive Well-Being, Inc.
4. Urban Graffiti Enterprise, Inc.

Region 2

1. Bread & Water Landscape, LLC
2. BriteWorks, Inc.
3. Strive Well-Being, Inc.
4. Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.

Region 3

1. Bread & Water Landscape, LLC
2. BriteWorks, Inc.
3. CRCD Enterprises
4. Strive Well-Being, Inc.
5. Ultimate Paints, Inc.
6. Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.

B. Evaluation of Proposals

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro’s Facilities Contracted Maintenance Services, Facilities/Property Maintenance, and Art Management & Cultural Programming was convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received for all three regions.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria:

Minimum Qualification Evaluation: This is a pass/fail criteria. To be responsive to the RFP minimum qualification requirements, proposers must meet all of the following:

- a) Must have at least three years of experience performing comprehensive graffiti removal services;
- b) Must submit reference information;
- c) Must submit a report listing safety training that the project managers/supervisors have received within the last three years; and
- d) Must submit a copy of the Proposer’s/subcontractor’s valid and active State of California C-33 license for painting and C61/D-38 specialty license for sand and water blasting.

Weighted Evaluation: Proposers that met the Phase I Evaluation criteria were then evaluated based on the following weighted criteria:

- Qualifications of the Firm/Team 15%
- Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel 20%
- Work Plan/Approach 35%
- Cost Proposal 30%

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for similar procurements. Several factors were considered in developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to the work plan/approach.

Evaluations were conducted from January 16, 2024, through April 12, 2024.

On March 9, 2024, Metro’s Diversity & Economic Opportunity Department (DEOD) determined Ultimate Paints, Inc. and CRCD Enterprises to be non-responsive for failing to meet the Small Business Prime Set-Aside requirements for the solicitation. Hence, both firms were excluded from further consideration.

The PET deemed the remaining proposers to be responsive to the minimum qualification evaluation and continued with the weighted evaluation.

The PET independently evaluated and scored the technical proposals and determined that BriteWorks, Inc. was the top-ranked firm for Region 1 and Bread & Water Landscape, LLC was the top-ranked firm for Regions 2 and 3.

Qualifications Summary of Firms:

Bread & Water Landscape, LLC

Bread & Water Landscape, LLC (Bread & Water), located in Pacoima, CA, has been in business for over 4 years. It caters to both commercial and residential clients providing landscaping and weed abatement removal services, trash removal, illegal dumping cleanups, and graffiti removal. Bread & Water is a Metro-certified SBE firm.

BriteWorks, Inc.

BriteWorks, Inc., headquartered in Covina, CA, has been in business for 25 years. It provides commercial and janitorial services throughout the state. Clients include the City of Irwindale and Police Department, City of West Covina and its Senior Centers and Police Department, Coca-Cola, Disney, Irwindale City Brewery, United States Department of Agriculture, and the Army Corps of Engineers. BriteWorks is a Metro-certified SBE firm.

Strive Well-Being, Inc.

Strive Well-Being, Inc., headquartered in San Diego, CA, has been in business for 16 years. It primarily provides consulting and program management, facility and safety management, fitness and wellness services. Its subcontractor has been providing graffiti abatement, graffiti solutions and pressure washing services since 1993. Strive Well-Being, Inc. is a Metro-certified SBE firm.

Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.

Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc., headquartered in Azusa, CA, has been in business for 33 years. It currently provides graffiti removal, anti-graffiti coating, steam cleaning, pressure washing and trash collection services to Metrolink, City of San Fernando, City of Burbank, City of West Hollywood, City of Covina, Compton, Arcadia, and various municipalities in Orange and Riverside Counties. Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc. is a Metro-certified SBE firm.

The following is a summary of the PET scores.

Region 1

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	BriteWorks, Inc.				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	88.00	15.00%	13.20	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	90.00	20.00%	18.00	
5	Work Plan/Approach	92.00	35.00%	32.20	
6	Cost Proposal	96.10	30.00%	28.83	
7	Total		100.00%	92.23	1

8	Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.				
9	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	86.67	15.00%	13.00	
10	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	82.50	20.00%	16.50	
11	Work Plan/Approach	90.00	35.00%	31.50	
12	Cost Proposal	100.00	30.00%	30.00	
13	Total		100.00%	91.00	2
14	Bread & Water Landscape, LLC				
15	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	86.67	15.00%	13.00	
16	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	90.00	20.00%	18.00	
17	Work Plan/Approach	92.66	35.00%	32.43	
18	Cost Proposal	87.53	30.00%	26.26	
19	Total		100.00%	89.69	3
20	Strive Well-Being, Inc.				
21	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	79.33	15.00%	11.90	
22	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	79.15	20.00%	15.83	
23	Work Plan/Approach	86.66	35.00%	30.33	
24	Cost Proposal	96.63	30.00%	28.99	
25	Total		100.00%	87.05	4

Region 2

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	Bread & Water, Landscape, LLC				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	86.67	15.00%	13.00	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	90.00	20.00%	18.00	
5	Work Plan/Approach	92.66	35.00%	32.43	
6	Cost Proposal	100.00	30.00%	30.00	

7	Total		100.00%	93.43	1
8	BriteWorks, Inc.				
9	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	88.00	15.00%	13.20	
10	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	90.00	20.00%	18.00	
11	Work Plan/Approach	92.00	35.00%	32.20	
12	Cost Proposal	92.17	30.00%	27.65	
13	Total		100.00%	91.05	2
14	Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.				
15	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	86.67	15.00%	13.00	
16	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	82.50	20.00%	16.50	
17	Work Plan/Approach	90.00	35.00%	31.50	
18	Cost Proposal	98.00	30.00%	29.40	
19	Total		100.00%	90.40	3
20	Strive Well-Being, Inc.				
21	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	79.33	15.00%	11.90	
22	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	79.15	20.00%	15.83	
23	Work Plan/Approach	86.66	35.00%	30.33	
24	Cost Proposal	97.23	30.00%	29.17	
25	Total		100.00%	87.23	4

Region 3

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	Bread & Water Landscape, LLC				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	86.67	15.00%	13.00	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	90.00	20.00%	18.00	
5	Work Plan/Approach	92.66	35.00%	32.43	
6	Cost Proposal	100.00	30.00%	30.00	
7	Total		100.00%	93.43	1
8	BriteWorks, Inc.				
9	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	88.00	15.00%	13.20	
10	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	90.00	20.00%	18.00	
11	Work Plan/Approach	92.00	35.00%	32.20	
12	Cost Proposal	92.00	30.00%	27.60	
13	Total		100.00%	91.00	2
14	Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.				
15	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	86.67	15.00%	13.00	
16	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	82.50	20.00%	16.50	
17	Work Plan/Approach	90.00	35.00%	31.50	
18	Cost Proposal	97.97	30.00%	29.39	
19	Total		100.00%	90.39	3
20	Strive Well-Being, Inc.				
21	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	79.33	15.00%	11.90	
22	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	79.15	20.00%	15.83	
23	Work Plan/Approach	86.66	35.00%	30.33	
24	Cost Proposal	92.60	30.00%	27.78	
25	Total		100.00%	85.84	4

C. Price Analysis

Region 1

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, technical analysis, fact-finding and negotiations. Staff successfully negotiated a cost savings of \$66,759.

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE	Recommended Amount
1	BriteWorks, Inc.	\$4,648,770	\$4,491,630	\$4,582,011
2	Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.	\$4,467,600		
3	Bread & Water Landscape, LLC	\$5,103,750		
4	Strive Well-Being, Inc.	\$4,623,300		

Region 2

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, technical analysis, fact-finding and negotiations. Staff successfully negotiated a cost savings of \$59,040.

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE	Recommended Amount
1	Bread & Water Landscape, LLC	\$5,792,760	\$6,080,280	\$5,733,720
2	BriteWorks, Inc.	\$6,285,600		
3	Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.	\$5,910,840		
4	Strive Well-Being, Inc.	\$5,957,280		

Region 3

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, technical analysis, fact-finding and negotiations. Staff successfully negotiated a cost savings of \$78,560.

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE	Recommended Amount
1	Bread & Water Landscape, LLC	\$7,541,480	\$7,931,750	\$7,462,920
2	BriteWorks, Inc.	\$8,198,060		
3	Strive Well-Being, Inc.	\$8,144,910		
4	Urban Graffiti Enterprises	\$7,698,600		

D. Background on Recommended Contractors

Region 1

BriteWorks, Inc. (BriteWorks), founded in 1996, is a minority, woman-owned corporation. It specializes in commercial and industrial quality cleaning for the business community. BriteWorks currently provides graffiti abatement and trash removal services to Metro as a subcontractor and performance has been satisfactory.

The BriteWorks team includes one SBE subcontractor that will provide painting services and one non-SBE subcontractor that will handle some of the chemical graffiti removal work. The non-SBE subcontractor has been providing graffiti abatement services to Metro since 2015 and performance has been satisfactory.

Region 2 & Region 3

Bread & Water Landscape, LLC (Bread & Water), founded in 2019, has been providing graffiti abatement services, landscaping and weed abatement removal services, trash removal, and illegal dumping cleanups since 2020.

The Bread & Water team includes a non-SBE subcontractor that has been providing graffiti abatement services to Metro since 2001 and performance has been satisfactory.