

PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

DIVISION 6 JOINT DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITY IN VENICE

1.	RFP Number: PS102680-PS64777	
2.	Recommended Vendor: Metro Venice Art Collective, LLC	
3.	Type of Procurement (check one): <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Joint Development	
4.	Procurement Dates:	
	A. Issued: April 14, 2023	
	B. Advertised/Publicized: April 14, 2023	
	C. Pre-Proposal Conference: May 3, 2023	
	D. Proposals Due: September 28, 2023	
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: N/A	
	F. Ethics Declaration Forms submitted to Ethics: September 29, 2023	
	G. Protest Period End Date: June 25, 2024	
5.	Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded: 5	Bids/Proposals Received: 2
6.	Contract Administrator: Armine Menemshyan	Telephone Number: 213-922-4851
7.	Project Manager: Carey Jenkins	Telephone Number: 213-547-4356

A. Procurement Background

This Board Action is to approve an Exclusive Negotiations Agreement and Planning Document (ENA) for the development of Metro-owned property at the former Division 6 Bus Yard in the Venice community of the City of Los Angeles. Board approval of agreements are subject to resolution of any properly submitted protest(s), if any.

A two-step procurement process was used for this Joint Development opportunity which is larger and more complex than typical Joint Development projects.

Step one, or Request for Interest and Qualifications (RFIQ) No. PS64777, was issued on December 17, 2019 to select potential developers based on project understanding and approach, development team experience, financials, and community and stakeholder engagement. Seven submittals were received in February 2020. The submittals were evaluated, and five developers were shortlisted to advance to step two, or the Request for Proposal (RFP) stage of the solicitation process.

Step two, RFP No. PS102680-PS64777, was issued to the short-listed developers from step one. The RFP requested a more detailed development proposal for the site, development program, site plan and renderings, commitment to affordable housing, inclusion of community-based organizations and small/disadvantaged business enterprises, and project financial information.

Two amendments were issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on May 26, 2023, extended the proposal due date.
- Amendment No. 2, issued on August 3, 2023, extended the proposal due date.

A virtual pre-proposal meeting was held on May 3, 2023, and was attended by 10 participants representing 5 firms. There were 28 questions asked and responses were released prior to the proposal due date.

Two proposals were received on September 28, 2023, from the following firms listed below in alphabetical order:

- Camden RE Ventures LLC
- Metro Venice Art Collective, LLC

B. Evaluation of Proposals

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro's Joint Development and Art Asset Management and Cultural Programming departments, representatives from the City of Los Angeles, and a local Venice community representative was convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and weights:

- | | |
|--|------------|
| • Vision, Scope, and Design | 25 percent |
| • Design | 20 percent |
| • Development Team Experience and Financial Capacity | 15 percent |
| • Financial Information and Offer | 15 percent |
| • Implementation | 10 percent |
| • Community Engagement & Public Workshop | 15 percent |

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for previous similar Joint Development opportunity procurements. Several factors were considered when developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to vision, scope, and design.

During the period of October 11, 2023, to March 4, 2024, the PET independently evaluated and scored the proposals.

Both proposals were determined to be within the competitive range and proposers were invited to participate in a virtual Open House/Public Workshop held on March 18, 2024.

More than 180 community members attended the Open House/Public Workshop. Metro staff presented an overview of the development process, and the two proposers presented their design concepts to the public for the first time. Following the presentations, the Metro-facilitated Q&A session heard more than 150 comments and questions reflecting the high level of interest from the Venice community in this project. Metro staff addressed questions about the Joint Development and developer selection process, the project timeline, ownership and management of the property, outreach noticing and Metro's commitment to affordable housing.

The two proposers provided responses to questions about the makeup of their respective teams, addressed community concerns over housing and affordability, retail, height restrictions, parking, traffic, safety, sustainability, community access, infrastructure improvements, and partnerships with community-based organizations.

Proposers were required to provide written narratives describing concerns that were expressed by members of the public at the workshop, as well as a strategy for addressing those concerns. Following the Open House/Public Workshop and after reviewing the narratives, the PET determined that Metro Venice Art Collective, LLC was the highest scored proposer to enter into an ENA.

Qualifications Summary of Firms within the Competitive Range:

Metro Venice Art Collective, LLC

Metro Venice Art Collective, LLC, a California limited liability company, is owned and controlled by The Pinyon Group LLC. Headquartered in Los Angeles, California, The Pinyon Group is a minority-owned, vertically-integrated, full-service real estate development, investment, construction management, and advisory firm with over \$5 billion of project experience in urban development including market rate, mixed-income, and affordable housing, and commercial development.

Camden RE Ventures LLC

Camden Securities Company, the parent company of Camden RE Ventures, LLC, is a fully integrated owner, operator, developer, investor, and property management firm of real estate assets focusing on mixed-use properties including multi-family and retail, senior living, luxury condominium units and hotel suites. Presently, the parent company is invested in the ownership and development of more than 2.5 million square feet of retail shopping centers and over 7,500 multi-family units.

The following table summarizes the final scores:

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	Metro Venice Art Collective, LLC				
3	Vision, Scope, and Design	72.00	25.00%	18.00	
4	Design	74.00	20.00%	14.80	
5	Development Team Experience and Financial Capacity	80.00	15.00%	12.00	
6	Financial Information and Offer	48.66	15.00%	7.30	
7	Implementation	47.30	10.00%	4.73	
8	Community Engagement & Public Workshop	76.53	15.00%	11.48	
9	Total		100.00%	68.31	1
10	Camden RE Ventures LLC				
11	Vision, Scope, and Design	64.00	25.00%	16.00	
12	Design	70.00	20.00%	14.00	
13	Development Team Experience and Financial Capacity	63.00	15.00%	9.45	
14	Financial Information and Offer	44.00	15.00%	6.60	
15	Implementation	44.00	10.00%	4.40	
16	Community Engagement & Public Workshop	52.53	15.00%	7.88	
17	Total		100.00%	58.33	2

C. Background on Recommended Contractor

Metro Venice Art Collective, LLC, a California limited liability company is owned and controlled by The Pinyon Group, a Los Angeles based firm specializing in real estate development, investment, construction management, and advisory services with over \$5 billion of project experience.