

February 26, 2015

MTA Board of Directors

MOTION

Directors Antonovich and Solis

MTA Rail Red Light Violations and Agency Safety Culture

The MTA Board has made a firm commitment on behalf of its riders to create a strong safety culture for the agency, recognizing that rail accidents in particular are often tragic final outcomes of an agency that has not provided a strong focus on fostering and maintaining a strong safety culture for the agency over a period of time.

The MTA board approved a motion in October 2011 (Attachment A) that sought a full review of the safety culture of the agency, with the understanding that this effort would become even more necessary as our rail system simultaneously ages (the Blue Line turns 25 years old this year) and expands (starting with extensions to Azusa and Santa Monica opening in early 2016).

To maintain a strong safety culture, the Board expects the CEO and staff to monitor continuously the safety of our system and work with the Board to develop policies and seek resources to resolve problems and trends that undermine the safe operation of our system.

Antithetical to a strong safety culture is the presence of Red Light violations on our rail system. We have seen in this County the tragedy that ensues from a Red Light violation, most notably in 2008 when a Metrolink engineer (operator) ran a Red Light and crashed his train into a freight train, killing 25 people and injuring over 100 more.

MTA has had its share of close calls in recent years with Red Light violations. An August 2012 accident that involved a Blue Line train striking an MTA bus was the result of a Red Light violation by the train. Only luck prevented the train from hitting the bus more squarely, which could have caused more injuries—in number and in severity—than the 31 minor injuries reported.

While Metrolink staff took immediate action to drive down red light violations and adopt a zero tolerance approach to such violations in the wake of the Chatsworth crash, the MTA's response after the Blue Line crash has been ineffective.

Over the past 24 months, the MTA has had 38 Red Light violations recorded. Even more alarming is that over the past two years, the Blue Line—which has the most complex operational environment of all our light rail lines due to the adjacent freight tracks within the right-of-way and number of at-grade crossings—has had 24 Red Light violations —an average of one per month. The Gold Line has had seven (7) in that same timeframe. Both the MTA rail system as a whole and the Blue Line have experienced more Red Light violations in the past 12 months (20 and 14, respectively) than the prior 12 months (18 and 10), suggesting a trend that is getting worse, not better.

A couple of Red Light violations over the course of the year could be the result of isolated operator error – however, 38 Red Light violations over 2 years signal a failure of effective management and focus by the CEO to identify and resolve this breakdown in MTA’s safety culture and operational safety with appropriate urgency.

WE THEREFORE MOVE that the MTA Board directs the Inspector General to

- A. conduct research into an appropriate zero-tolerance policy for Red Light violations for our Rail and Bus system and return to the Board in March with such a policy for consideration; and
- B. retain an independent consultant with expertise in safety culture and rail operational safety to conduct a review of MTA rail operations and management, including a root cause analysis of the Red Light violations committed over the past two years.
 - This review must at minimum include an analysis of safety culture, infrastructure issues, operator training, use of efficiency testing, and effectiveness of discipline for both operator and management.

WE FURTHER MOVE that the MTA Board sends a letter to the Administrators of the Federal Transit Administration and Federal Railroad Administration to seek partnerships in working with the MTA to reduce Red Light violations system-wide and to evaluate current policies, conditions, and management structures for flaws and deviations from industry best practices.

LACMTA
Full Board Meeting
October 27, 2011

MOTION
Director Antonovich

The top priority for the MTA Board of Directors has been and must always be exercising vigilant oversight of MTA's bus and rail system to ensure the safety and integrity of our transit system for every one of our 38 million monthly passengers. As a Board we must remain committed to this priority and continually strive to improve the safety culture at MTA in a proactive manner, rather than in a reactive manner after suffering a major accident, such as the one on June 22, 2009, that claimed 9 lives and injured 76 other passengers on the Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority (WMATA) subway system.

In its report on this tragic accident, the National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) determined that this accident was not just the result of operator error or faulty equipment, but rather served as "an example of a 'quintessential organizational accident.'" In short, the NTSB directly called into question WMATA's safety culture and the effectiveness of the WMATA Board's oversight responsibility for system and organizational safety.

ANTONOVICH MOTION

October 27, 2011

To ensure that we as a Board are fulfilling our oversight duties to the fullest extent possible, it is vital that we have a thorough review of our safety culture.

Our capabilities will be tested in the coming months and years as we aggressively expand our bus and rail system with the opening of the Expo Line to Culver City, followed by the Crenshaw/LAX Line, the Regional Connector, and extensions on Gold Line, Expo Line, Orange Line and Purple Line to Azusa, Santa Monica, Chatsworth and West Los Angeles, respectively. Should the America Fast Forward plan come to fruition, additional rail and bus projects will be implemented at a faster pace than expected.

Simultaneously, we will be faced with maintaining an aging rail system—with the Blue Line (opened in 1990), Red Line (1993-2000) and Gold Line (2003) reaching significant milestones in maturity—and fleet that will require rehabilitation.

ANTONOVICH MOTION

October 27, 2011

Fostering a vigorous and effective culture of safety at MTA requires the Board to take overt leadership to influence the behavior and expectations of all MTA employees to place safety above other competing priorities. According to Dr. James Reason, a leading scholar in this field, a **safety culture** consists of five elements – an **informed culture**, a **reporting culture**, a **learning culture**, a **flexible culture** and a **just culture**:

- An **informed culture** is one in which the organization collects and analyzes relevant data while also disseminating safety information throughout the organization.
- A **reporting culture** encourages employees to report safety concerns with confidentiality and without blame.
- A **learning culture** allows an organization to learn from mistakes and continually react to feedback and new information.
- A **flexible culture** provides for an organization and employees that can adapt in an effective manner to changing demands on the system.
- A **just culture** allows for maximum avoidance of major errors by differentiating consequences resulting from unintentional and intentional unsafe acts.

ANTONOVICH MOTION

October 27, 2011

To accomplish a healthy safety culture, it is incumbent upon the Board to take a very clear leadership role in its actions and its policies, from simple steps of renaming its committees and updating its bylaws to ensconce safety as our primary organizational value, to conducting a thorough review of our safety culture and maintaining frequent and meaningful oversight over safety at our meetings.

We can accomplish this goal by:

- reviewing thoroughly the safety culture of our organization
- clarifying our organizational values to support safety as our primary value
- reorganizing our committee structure to highlight and centralize the Board's fundamental responsibility to oversee safety
- developing frequent and comprehensive reports and agenda items regarding system safety for Board discussion and action

ANTONOVICH MOTION

October 27, 2011

I THEREFORE MOVE that the MTA Board takes the following actions:

- (1) Direct the CEO to provide a literature review to the Board within 60 days on the topic of “safety culture”. In particular, this review should clearly delineate the Board’s role and responsibilities to ensure and support fully a strong safety culture at MTA, as well as provide a review of the WMATA accident and subsequent NTSB report.

- (2) Direct the CEO to procure an outside, independent consultant to conduct and complete within 90 days a full review of MTA’s safety culture, including specific evaluations of the five elements (informed culture, reporting culture, learning culture, flexible culture and just culture) that compose a safety culture, and present an evaluation of and recommendations on how to improve MTA’s safety culture to the Board and CEO. The CEO shall follow-up within 30 days with a presentation to the Board on additional recommendations and a plan to implement all recommendations to enhance MTA’s safety culture.

- (3) Change the name of the “**Operations Committee**” to the “**System Safety and Operations Committee**” to indicate clearly the Board’s central role of providing oversight of MTA’s safety culture and system safety.

ANTONOVICH MOTION

October 27, 2011

- (4) Expand the scope of the “**System Safety and Operations Committee**” to include:
 - a. Monthly reports on corporate safety and system safety
 - b. All items related to safety audits, safety upgrades, and overall system safety issues
 - c. All recommendations on how to improve the safety culture at MTA
- (5) Direct the CEO to report to the full Board on a quarterly basis on MTA’s system safety and provide recommendations on how the Board can better support the agency’s safety culture and the safety of our transit system.
- (6) Direct the CEO to provide a review of our agency bylaws and any associated statement of organizational values and Board responsibilities to determine if these documents promote safety as the Board’s top oversight role and the agency’s top priority.
- (7) Direct the CEO to include as part of each board report and agenda item a separate, clearly marked section that provides an assessment of the item’s impact on system safety and safety culture.

ATTACHMENT B

Red Signal Rail Violations

2011-2014

By Line and By Year

Violations	2011	2012	2013	2014	TOTAL
BLUE	6	17	14	15	52
EXPO		3	2	2	7
GOLD	2	7	6	2	17
RED	3	1	0	2	6
GREEN	0	1	0	0	1
TOTAL	11	29	22	21	83

Red Signal Rule Violations
02/01/2010 Through 12/31/2014

YEAR	Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2010	1,557,188	04/01/10 03:56PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	1
2011	2,017,188	05/19/11 06:22PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	6
	2,039,899	07/30/11 11:46PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,045,615	08/17/11 06:09PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,069,338	10/05/11 05:33PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,091,421	11/08/11 06:30PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,112,199	12/12/11 11:23AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
2012	2,125,506	01/11/12 04:26PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	17
	2,129,632	01/22/12 02:02PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,157,774	03/25/12 04:00PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,164,329	04/10/12 09:08AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,165,974	04/14/12 10:57AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,166,637	04/15/12 12:06PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,168,568	04/20/12 08:04AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,171,024	04/25/12 02:17PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,173,215	04/30/12 05:28PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,211,635	08/01/12 02:10PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,231,724	09/20/12 08:59AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,233,437	09/25/12 05:23PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,234,726	09/28/12 02:36PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,234,850	09/29/12 04:40AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,246,790	10/30/12 11:42AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,255,639	11/22/12 11:43PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
2,264,396	12/19/12 07:02AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue		

2013	2,272,162	01/10/13	10:09AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	14
	2,274,173	01/16/13	06:18AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,275,609	01/19/13	12:48PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,277,118	01/23/13	05:16PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,282,987	02/07/13	07:15PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,315,916	05/06/13	04:55AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,323,007	05/26/13	01:35PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,323,855	05/29/13	08:16AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,339,316	07/01/13	04:54PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,361,294	09/05/13	08:27PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,365,773	09/18/13	05:48AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,401,617	12/22/13	04:01PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,403,841	12/29/13	10:55PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,403,850	12/29/13	10:58PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
2014	2,404,777	01/01/14	11:26AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	15
	2,410,959	01/18/14	02:53PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,414,720	01/28/14	06:17PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,420,442	02/13/14	09:15AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,423,811	02/21/14	11:24PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,432,120	03/15/14	07:46PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,441,775	04/10/14	12:13AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,448,879	04/29/14	09:38PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,463,230	06/01/14	10:46AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,483,041	07/16/14	06:04PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,491,647	08/08/14	12:43AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,516,211	10/08/14	05:41PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,521,078	10/20/14	10:04PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
	2,529,442	11/11/14	05:00PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	
2,538,388	12/06/14	10:58AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue		

**Red Signal Rule Violations
02/01/2010 Through 12/31/2014**

*Revenue Service began in April 2012; last 2 stations opened in June 2012

YEAR	Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2012*	2,215,210	08/09/12 09:53AM	Red Signal Main Line	Expo	3
	2,240,624	10/15/12 01:07AM	Red Signal Main Line	Expo	
	2,261,247	12/10/12 06:53AM	Red Signal Main Line	Expo	
2013	2,300,472	03/20/13 10:20AM	Red Signal Main Line	Expo	2
	2,314,918	05/02/13 01:07PM	Red Signal Main Line	Expo	
2014	2,485,925	07/24/14 02:59PM	Red Signal Main Line	Expo	2
	2,529,698	11/12/14 11:37AM	Red Signal Main Line	Expo	

Red Signal Rule Violations
02/01/2010 Through 12/31/2014

YEAR	Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2010	1,564,934	04/07/10 09:02AM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	5
	1,569,362	04/09/10 05:00PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
	1,858,418	10/26/10 01:12PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
	1,898,560	11/23/10 02:17PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
	1,915,798	12/07/10 11:10AM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
2011	2,044,819	08/15/11 09:42PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	2
	2,097,746	11/17/11 06:24PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
2012	2,127,739	01/17/12 05:22PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	7
	2,157,374	03/23/12 02:44PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
	2,186,553	05/31/12 03:35PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
	2,214,401	08/07/12 07:19PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
	2,223,343	08/29/12 07:20PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
	2,229,760	09/15/12 01:06PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
	2,258,871	12/02/12 03:38PM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	
2013	2,269,508	01/03/13 08:26AM	Red Signal Mail Line	Gold	6
	2,292,899	03/02/13 12:41PM	Red Signal Main Line	Gold	
	2,309,505	04/16/13 09:48AM	Red Signal Main Line	Gold	
	2,309,928	04/17/13 12:00PM	Red Signal Main Line	Gold	
	2,353,512	08/16/13 07:56AM	Red Signal Main Line	Gold	
	2,356,106	08/23/13 06:30AM	Red Signal Main Line	Gold	
2014	2,473,300	06/26/14 08:10PM	Red Signal Main Line	Gold	2
	2,516,848	10/10/14 03:30AM	Red Signal Main Line	Gold	

**Red Signal Rule Violations
02/01/2010 Through 12/31/2014**

YEAR	Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2011	2,015,566	05/14/11 05:49PM	Red Signal Main Line	Red	3
	2,068,527	10/03/11 04:37PM	Red Signal Main Line	Red	
	2,079,395	10/18/11 01:10PM	Red Signal Main Line	Red	
2012	2,222,537	08/27/12 10:17PM	Red Signal Main Line	Red	1
2013	--	--	Red Signal Main Line	Red	0
2014	2,514,606	10/05/14 05:54AM	Red Signal Main Line	Red	2
	2,521,475	10/21/14 07:35PM	Red Signal Main Line	Red	

**Red Signal Rule Violations
02/01/2010 Through 12/31/2014**

YEAR	Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2010	<i>1,783,651</i>	<i>09/03/10 05:38AM</i>	<i>Red Signal Yard</i>	<i>Green</i>	0
2011	<i>2,020,074</i>	<i>05/29/11 03:05PM</i>	<i>Red Signal Yard</i>	<i>Green</i>	0
2012	2,265,270	12/21/12 07:42AM	Red Signal Main Line	Green	1
2013	--	--			0
2014	--	--			0

**Red Signal Rule Violations
2011**

Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2,017,188	05/19/11 06:22PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	6
2,039,899	07/30/11 11:46PM			
2,045,615	08/17/11 06:09PM			
2,069,338	10/05/11 05:33PM			
2,091,421	11/08/11 06:30PM			
2,112,199	12/12/11 11:23AM			
2,044,819	08/15/11 09:42PM	Red Signal Main Line	Gold	2
2,097,746	11/17/11 06:24PM			
2,015,566	05/14/11 05:49PM	Red Signal Main Line	Red	3
2,068,527	10/03/11 04:37PM			
2,079,395	10/18/11 01:10PM			

2011 TOTAL	11
-------------------	-----------

**Red Signal Rule Violations
2012**

Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2,125,506	01/11/12 04:26PM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	17
2,129,632	01/22/12 02:02PM			
2,157,774	03/25/12 04:00PM			
2,164,329	04/10/12 09:08AM			
2,165,974	04/14/12 10:57AM			
2,166,637	04/15/12 12:06PM			
2,168,568	04/20/12 08:04AM			
2,171,024	04/25/12 02:17PM			
2,173,215	04/30/12 05:28PM			
2,211,635	08/01/12 02:10PM			
2,231,724	09/20/12 08:59AM			
2,233,437	09/25/12 05:23PM			
2,234,726	09/28/12 02:36PM			
2,234,850	09/29/12 04:40AM			
2,246,790	10/30/12 11:42AM			
2,255,639	11/22/12 11:43PM			
2,264,396	12/19/12 07:02AM			
2,215,210	08/09/12 09:53AM	Expo	3	
2,240,624	10/15/12 01:07AM			
2,261,247	12/10/12 06:53AM			
2,127,739	01/17/12 05:22PM	Gold	7	
2,157,374	03/23/12 02:44PM			
2,186,553	05/31/12 03:35PM			
2,214,401	08/07/12 07:19PM			
2,223,343	08/29/12 07:20PM			
2,229,760	09/15/12 01:06PM			
2,258,871	12/02/12 03:38PM			
2,222,537	08/27/12 10:17PM	Red	1	
2,265,270	12/21/12 07:42AM	Green	1	

2012 TOTAL	29
-------------------	-----------

**Red Signal Rule Violations
2013**

Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2,272,162	01/10/13 10:09AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	14
2,274,173	01/16/13 06:18AM			
2,275,609	01/19/13 12:48PM			
2,277,118	01/23/13 05:16PM			
2,282,987	02/07/13 07:15PM			
2,315,916	05/06/13 04:55AM			
2,323,007	05/26/13 01:35PM			
2,323,855	05/29/13 08:16AM			
2,339,316	07/01/13 04:54PM			
2,361,294	09/05/13 08:27PM			
2,365,773	09/18/13 05:48AM			
2,401,617	12/22/13 04:01PM			
2,403,841	12/29/13 10:55PM			
2,403,850	12/29/13 10:58PM			
2,300,472	03/20/13 10:20AM	Expo	2	
2,314,918	05/02/13 01:07PM			
2,269,508	01/03/13 08:26AM	Gold	6	
2,292,899	03/02/13 12:41PM			
2,309,505	04/16/13 09:48AM			
2,309,928	04/17/13 12:00PM			
2,353,512	08/16/13 07:56AM			
2,356,106	08/23/13 06:30AM			
--	--	Red	0	

2013 TOTAL	22
-------------------	-----------

**Red Signal Rule Violations
2014**

Incident ID	Incident Date	Type	Line	TOTAL #
2,404,777	01/01/14 11:26AM	Red Signal Main Line	Blue	15
2,410,959	01/18/14 02:53PM			
2,414,720	01/28/14 06:17PM			
2,420,442	02/13/14 09:15AM			
2,423,811	02/21/14 11:24PM			
2,432,120	03/15/14 07:46PM			
2,441,775	04/10/14 12:13AM			
2,448,879	04/29/14 09:38PM			
2,463,230	06/01/14 10:46AM			
2,483,041	07/16/14 06:04PM			
2,491,647	08/08/14 12:43AM			
2,516,211	10/08/14 05:41PM			
2,521,078	10/20/14 10:04PM			
2,529,442	11/11/14 05:00PM			
2,538,388	12/06/14 10:58AM			
2,485,925	07/24/14 02:59PM	Expo	2	
2,529,698	11/12/14 11:37AM			
2,473,300	06/26/14 08:10PM	Gold	2	
2,516,848	10/10/14 03:30AM			
2,514,606	10/05/14 05:54AM	Red	2	
2,521,475	10/21/14 07:35PM			

2014 TOTAL	21
-------------------	-----------