

## RESULTS OF JANUARY 17, 2018 PUBLIC HEARING FOR CUSTOMER READINESS RECOMMENDATIONS FOR TRANSFER ON 2<sup>ND</sup> BOARDING

### PUBLIC COMMENT

On Wednesday, January 17, 2018, a public hearing on possible customer readiness recommendations was held with the Finance, Audit and Budget Committee of the Metro Board. Out of an estimated customer base of 1.2 million daily transit riders, testimony from six speakers was heard. In addition to the verbal testimony, 70 emails and other written comments were submitted into the public record on this subject. Collectively, 76 responses on the fare proposals were received by the close of the public record through midnight, January 17, 2018.

Below is a summary of the written and oral comments relevant to the customer readiness recommendations for Transfer on 2<sup>nd</sup> Boarding.

#### *Replace Day Pass Sales with Stored Value onboard Bus*

Of the 29 comments received on this topic, 11 comments favored the recommendation to replace Day Pass sales with Stored Value on bus. The remaining 18 comments raised concerns with this recommendation. With consideration to the written and oral comments received on this topic, staff supports the original recommendation to replace Day Pass sales with Stored Value on buses. A summary of comments and staff responses are highlighted below:

#### *Summary of Comments*

Comments	Staff Responses
Transit dependent riders do not live near TAP vending machines and therefore do not have other convenient methods for purchases Day Passes	Day Pass sales will continue to be available online at <i>taptogo.net</i> , by calling 866.TAPTOGO, at Metro Customer Centers, at TAP vending machines located at all Metro rail, Silver Line and Orange Line stations, at El Monte Transit Center, at Patsaouras Bus Plaza, and at over 400 TAP vendor locations. As evidenced in the Title VI analysis on discontinuing Day Pass sales on bus (see Attachment C), there is no significant difference in minority representation between riders who only have walk access to the bus and those who also have walk access to other sources for TAP card reloading sources.
Potential financial impact on customers	With the addition of the Board Approved two hour Metro to Metro transfer, customers have the ability to pay a base fare of \$1.75 to travel in one direction on multiple lines. They can also make the return trip for \$1.75 as well, effectively saving \$3.50 when compared to the cost of a \$7 Day Pass. This is the primary reason for the 85% decline on Day Pass sales on bus.
Agree with the addition of Stored Value sales, however disagree with removing Day Pass sales	See above.
Stored Value sales onboard bus will prolong boarding times Bus operator farebox errors during Stored Value reloads will financially impact customers	TAP staff does not anticipate an increase in boarding time due to the fact that Day Passes will be removed. TAP expects to see a decrease in dwell times due to automatic payment of interagency transfers.

*Eliminate Tokens and Transition to TAP*

Of the 19 comments received on this topic, 11 comments favored the elimination of tokens and transition to TAP cards. The remaining 8 comments raised concerns with this recommendation. A summary of comments and staff responses are highlighted below:

*Summary of Comments*

Comments	Staff Responses
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Social Services and nonprofit organizations need tokens to distribute</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Social service agencies and nonprofit organizations will receive limited use TAP cards for distribution, which will work just like tokens with added benefits such as free Metro to Metro transfers.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Impact on riders with disabilities, including visually and cognitively impaired riders.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Staff will also work with Communications to launch a public information effort to encourage seniors and persons with disabilities, who pay with cash or tokens, to apply for a reduced fare TAP card.</li> <li>Reduced fare TAP cards enable riders to travel with free transfers and the ability to ride at the lowest possible base fare and monthly passes. TAP cards protect riders' fare balance from loss or theft. Cash and tokens cannot be replaced if lost or stolen.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Although Access ID TAP cards may be tapped for free fare on fixed route transit systems, Access vehicles do not have a TAP validator.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Just 2.5% of Access' vehicles transactions are paid for with tokens. Staff will work with Access to ensure their customers who use tokens can transition smoothly to other trip purchase options such as: Access coupon books, using cash and/or credit/debit cards.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>What do riders do with unused tokens?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Token sales will end mid-May 2018. Customers will have up to 18 months to use their existing supply of tokens</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Difficulty in determining TAP card balance. Tokens are distinguishable from U.S. currency</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Upon request, bus operators can tell passengers their TAP card balance information</li> <li>TAP vending machines can display or announce TAP card balance as well</li> </ul>

*\$2 TAP card cost consistency*

Of the 26 comments received on this topic, 12 comments favored making the \$2 TAP card cost consistent across all TAP card purchase points. The remaining 14 comments raised concerns with this recommendation. A summary of comments and staff responses are highlighted below:

*Summary of comments*

Comments	Staff Responses
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Impact on low income riders</li> <li>First time riders are disadvantaged</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>As the Title VI analysis (see Attachment H) reflects, there is no disparate impact on any group of riders including low income and first time riders, due to TAP cards having a 10 year lifetime, instead of 3 years</li> <li>Low income and first time riders can also take advantage of the free 1 million TAP card distribution</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TAP card cost should be \$1</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TAP cards are \$1 on Metro buses and at TAP vending machines as a result of a long running promotion where Metro subsidized the</li> </ul>

everywhere	<p>remaining \$1 to the TAP region. As that promotion comes to a close, TAP cards will be \$2 at all customer purchase touch points.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Reduced Fare TAP cards such as Senior/Disabled, College/Vocational and K-12 Student will remain free to qualifying customers.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TAP card costs should not be increased</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TAP card costs are currently not consistent across the system. They are \$2 when purchased online, by phone, at Metro Customer Centers and at over 400 TAP vendor locations.</li> <li>In addition, the TAP card life has increased from 3 to 10 years, making the impact de minimis.</li> </ul>

**PUBLIC HEARING COMMENTS**

WRITTEN COMMENTS																						
No.	Date Received in Public Hearing Inbox	Name	Email Address	Is the Comment on topic?	If Yes - Positive or Negative ?	If No or if Multiple Subjects - What is the Subject?	Brief Summary	Removal of Metro Day pass	Transfer fees	TAP card price	What to do with old tokens?	Replace Day pass with Stored Value on Bus	Transition Tokens to TAP	Transfer on 2nd boarding	Paper Transfers	Transfer time	Stored Value Min/Max	Mixing up IAT w/ Internal Metro transfer	Token-Social Service/ Non Profit	Metro Fares	TAP Provided Response to Constituent /Customer Relations	Other
1	12/12/2017 ; 12/14/17	Alexander Friedman	<a href="mailto:alek3773@gmail.com">alek3773@gmail.com</a>	No		IAT transfer fees	Question- is the proposed transfer to another bus agency also going to be free? Or will the cost be \$0.50 deducted from SV?		x													
2	12/13/2017	Hon Lung Cheng	<a href="mailto:chef_lung@yahoo.com">chef_lung@yahoo.com</a>	Yes	Both		Disabled patron requesting that day passes continue to be sold; Agrees with increasing TAP card price	x			x											
3	12/14/2017	Juanita Rubio-Griepsma	<a href="mailto:rubio@bacup.net">rubio@bacup.net</a>	Yes	Positive		"I vote YES"			x		x	x									
4	12/14/2017	Monica Murray	<a href="mailto:monicamurray79@yahoo.com">monicamurray79@yahoo.com</a>	Yes	Negative		Do not discontinue tokens. Limited access to TAP cards. Prefer cash and paper transfers						x									
5	12/14/2017	Scott Lawrence Lawson	<a href="mailto:scottlawrencelawson@gmail.com">scottlawrencelawson@gmail.com</a>	Yes	Negative		How does the TAP card price support transfers? Increase will hurt low income riders			x												
6	12/13/2017	Patrick Pun	<a href="mailto:pun.chunkit@yahoo.com">pun.chunkit@yahoo.com</a>	Yes	Negative	Stored Value purchases	Suggests adding SV and keeping Day Pass; eliminating day pass hurts customers who start their trip on the bus	x														
7	12/13/2017	Mark Bonilla	<a href="mailto:mark.mathguy@gmail.com">mark.mathguy@gmail.com</a>	Yes	Negative		Riders still need paper transfers in LA County; Use of an IAT automatically removes Metro internal free transfer								x							
8	12/13/2017	David Fukumoto	<a href="mailto:web@davidfukamoto.com">web@davidfukamoto.com</a>	Yes	Negative		TAP cards substandard quality; replacing day passes with SV will increase costs for riders; wants a 4 hour transfer period	x				x				x						











66	11/17/2018	Dwayne Coleman	<a href="mailto:dwayne.coleman55@yahoo.com">dwayne.coleman55@yahoo.com</a>	Yes	Negative		Regarding your proposal to have TAP cards \$2 everywhere sold, instead of \$1 in select locations; I think that is a bad idea. If anything, I think they should be \$1 everywhere. You also are processing to get rid of the Day Pass. That can be an inconvenience for visitors to the Los Angeles area if Day Passes are discontinued. Lastly, you mention how token sales have decreased. The fact that they are not at a discounted rate is why.	X		X			X								
67	1/17/2018	Katherine James	<a href="mailto:mzkl69@gmail.com">mzkl69@gmail.com</a>	Yes	Positive		adding the Municipal transfer to the TAP card would be less confusing and an easier transition for the Bus Operators instead of dealing with the paper transfers. Also, adding an addition 30 minutes to the 2nd boarding would be beneficial to the passengers if they missed their connection on the 2nd boarding due to various reasons and make it so their TAP Card isn't charged an additional fare if their time has expired.	X				X		X	X	X	X				
68	1/18/2018	Charles Michel Deemer	<a href="mailto:west_high_49er@iuno.com">west_high_49er@iuno.com</a>	Yes	Negative		people wanting to transfer between the 2 counties will be forced to pay full fare each time they travel between 2 counties for non TAP enabled agencies. 7-11 and \$2.00 TAP cards. Negative impact on loading SV on board buses, people fumble with the machines around 15-20% of the time just getting 1-2 dollar bills accepted. I totally disagree with your intention to stop the sale of day passes on buses. You're showing a discriminatory preference for one bus rider over another. I'd suggest to help mitigate boarding speed only \$10, \$20 and possibly \$50. bills be accepted to purchase Stored Value.	X		X		X				X			X		X
69	1/18/2018	Kenneth Hak	<a href="mailto:ken151996@gmail.com">ken151996@gmail.com</a>	Yes/No	Negative	Reduced Fare card + expiration	No token at 10.75 per bag . I dont want u guys to replace day pass sales with stored value sales abroad metro buses ? It would be nice if we can go on bus and train on same day when have at train station vending machine .	X					X								X



70	1/18/2018	Renee Bade	<a href="mailto:rbade@flash.net">rbade@flash.net</a>	Yes	Negative		Paying an extra \$2 to purchase a card is an even larger penalty. Paper day passes and tokens have no such penalty, but the proposal eliminates purchasing day passes on buses and eliminates tokens all together. TAP funds expire, huge issue for occasional riders. TAP cards expire, difficult + confusing to replace/purchase at TVM.			X											X		X
----	-----------	------------	--	-----	----------	--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--	---

ORAL TESTIMONY TRANSCRIPTIONS

No.	Date of Public Testimony	Name	Email Address	Is the Comment on topic?	If Yes - Positive or Negative ?	If No or if Multiple Subjects - What is the Subject?	Testimony Transcript	Removal of Metro Day pass	Transfer fees	TAP card price	What to do with old tokens?	Replace Day pass with Stored Value on Bus	Transition Tokens to TAP	Transfer on 2nd boarding	Paper Transfers	Transfer time	Stored Value Min/Mas	Mixing up IAT w/ Internal Metro transfer	Token-Social Service/ Non Profit	Metro Fares	TAP Provided Response to Constituent /Customer Relations	Other
-----	--------------------------	------	---------------	--------------------------	---------------------------------	--	----------------------	---------------------------	---------------	----------------	-----------------------------	---	--------------------------	--------------------------	-----------------	---------------	----------------------	--	----------------------------------	-------------	--	-------

71	1/17/2018	Amanda Staples	<a href="#">public comment</a>	yes	negative		Good afternoon. In regards to the second boarding readiness efforts, we submitted a letter and I have a hard copy as well but the visibility of the \$7 day pass for in speed option available on rail only and not for bus riders is really just where we find the most issue with, because it's still available to railriders and yet we treat the bus riders differently and I understand like it is it is quicker to just have the stored value on buses and we as users ourselves understand that but we just want to have the careful consideration of the differences that we use because the majority of transit riders are bus riders and so what kind of systems were putting in place for for them the majority of users in their accessibility and ease of use and so that's it.					x											
----	-----------	----------------	--------------------------------	-----	----------	--	---	--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

72	1/17/2018	Allan Routs	<a href="#">public comment</a>	yes	negative		I have been a bus rider for over 50 years now and I hope you don't decide to eliminate the day pass and I would hope that you would drop the price on the monthly TAP card because a \$100 is a lot. thank you thank you.					x								x			
----	-----------	-------------	--------------------------------	-----	----------	--	---	--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--





