

## PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

## SYSTEMWIDE PARKING OPERATOR SERVICES/PS66007000

1.	<b>Contract Number:</b> PS66007000	
2.	<b>Recommended Vendor:</b> L&R Auto Parks, Inc. DBA Joe's Auto Parks	
3.	<b>Type of Procurement (check one):</b> <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order	
4.	<b>Procurement Dates:</b>	
	<b>A. Issued:</b> October 2, 2019	
	<b>B. Advertised/Publicized:</b> October 1 and 2, 2019	
	<b>C. Pre-Proposal Conference:</b> October 9, 2019	
	<b>D. Proposals Due:</b> November 7, 2019	
	<b>E. Pre-Qualification Completed:</b> January 31, 2020	
	<b>F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics:</b> February 13, 2020	
	<b>G. Protest Period End Date:</b> March 24, 2020	
5.	<b>Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded:</b> 28	<b>Bids/Proposals Received:</b> 4
6.	<b>Contract Administrator:</b> Samira Baghdikian	<b>Telephone Number:</b> (213) 922-1033
7.	<b>Project Manager:</b> Stacie Endler	<b>Telephone Number:</b> (213) 922-2548

**A. Procurement Background**

This Board Action is to approve Contract No. PS66007000 issued in support of systemwide parking operator services through a revenue generating contract. Board approval of contract awards are subject to resolution of any properly submitted protest.

The Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is a firm fixed price.

One amendment was issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP to clarify that Exhibit 2, Schedule of Quantities was not required.

A pre-proposal conference was held on October 9, 2019 and was attended by 18 participants representing 13 companies. There were 46 questions asked, and responses were released prior to the proposal due date.

A total of four proposals were received on November 7, 2019.

**B. Evaluation of Proposals**

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro's Parking Management, City of Pasadena and City of Inglewood was convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and weights:

- Operational Plan 35 percent
- Experience 20 percent
- Appreciation and Customer Service 25 percent
- Price 20 percent

Several factors were considered when developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to the operational plan.

Of the four proposals received, two were determined to be within the competitive range and are listed below in alphabetical order:

1. L&R Auto Parks, Inc. DBA Joe's Auto Parks
2. SP+ Municipal Services

Two firms were determined to be outside the competitive range and were not included for further consideration. Examples that led to no further consideration include an operational plan failing to adequately demonstrate/identify auditing techniques, revenue control measures, and the ability to manage daily operations and staffing volumes and schedules. Quality control and/or operational control measures were not thoroughly explained. In addition, a customer service training plan was lacking or inadequate, and a customer call center requirement was not addressed as required in the RFP.

During the weeks of November 11, 2019 through December 2, 2019, the PET met and interviewed the firms. The firms' project managers and key team members had an opportunity to present each team's qualifications and respond to PET's questions. In general, each team's presentation addressed the requirements of the RFP, experience with all aspects of the required tasks, and stressed each firm's commitment to the success of the project. Also highlighted were operational and staffing plans, and perceived project issues. Each team was asked questions relative to each firm's proposal and previous experience.

### **Qualifications Summary of Firms within the Competitive Range:**

#### **L&R Auto Parks, Inc. DBA Joe's Auto Parks**

L&R Auto Parks, Inc. DBA Joe's Auto Parks (Joe's Auto Parks) has been involved in municipal parking operations for over 60 years and manages over 100 parking facilities in the downtown Los Angeles area. Joe's Auto Parks submitted a detailed proposal and assembled a cohesive team that demonstrated that they are knowledgeable, experienced and the most qualified firm to perform the required services.

Joe's Auto Parks is an experienced parking operator service provider and has extensive experience on the Program development and implementation as a capital and service provider. Joe's Auto Parks presented a solid organizational chart with clear management organization and support and was the only proposer to provide staffing volumes. Joe's Auto Parks also provided a thorough explanation of their customer service training program.

Joe's Auto Parks clearly identified a plan for daily operation to implement new facilities into the Parking Management Program and demonstrated experience in opening facilities. The plan outlined what to do pre-implementation, on implementation day and post-implementation of the Parking Management Program. The plan included the operations of payment kiosks, mobile application and revenue collection.

Joe's Auto Parks presented a 24/7 command center that is available for real-time visibility and management of parking facilities around the county. Joe's Auto Parks will have a dedicated line for Metro patrons to access 24/7.

### **SP+ Municipal Services**

SP+ Municipal Services (SP+) is a division of SP Plus Corporation formed in 1929 and offers a wide-array of parking management services. SP+ provides parking management services to municipalities, institutions, and governmental agencies.

SP+'s proposal clearly defined the organizational support from the corporate office and identified the management staff proposed. However, the operational plan staffing levels and schedules were not defined or appropriate for the term of the contract. SP+'s proposal outlined quality control measures relating to reporting and financial analysis but did not clearly identify other quality control measures relating to operations or functionality of the Program.

SP+ demonstrated experience in parking management with municipalities. Although the proposed staff demonstrated extensive parking management experience, SP+ did not outline staff experience in opening new locations. Metro is planning on opening several locations throughout the term of this contract and it is important to have a team experienced in opening new locations.

SP+ is an experienced firm but did not demonstrate understanding of Metro's objectives and requirements for this project.

Following is a summary of the PET evaluation scores:

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	<b>L&amp;R Auto Parks DBA Joe's Auto Park</b>				
3	Operational Plan	92.21	35.00%	32.27	
4	Experience	96.67	20.00%	19.33	
5	Appreciation and Customer Service	91.12	25.00%	22.78	
6	Price	90.00	20.00%	18.00	
7	<b>Total</b>		<b>100.00%</b>	<b>92.39</b>	<b>1</b>
8	<b>SP+ Municipal Services</b>				
9	Operational Plan	69.45	35.00%	24.31	
10	Experience	80.67	20.00%	16.13	
11	Appreciation and Customer Service	52.77	25.00%	13.19	
12	Price	80.00	20.00%	16.00	
13	<b>Total</b>		<b>100.00%</b>	<b>69.63</b>	<b>2</b>

### C. Price Analysis

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based upon an independent cost estimate (ICE), price analysis, and a technical analysis.

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE	Award Amount
1.	L&R Auto Parks DBA Joe's Auto Park	\$40,370,491	<b>\$46,240,000</b>	\$40,370,490
2.	SP+ Municipal Services	\$45,157,049	<b>\$46,240,000</b>	

This Contract is a net revenue generating contract. The contractor shall cover all equipment and operating costs and shall be compensated through the parking revenue collected on behalf of Metro. The purchase of the parking equipment and installation will be amortized throughout the seven-year contract term, on a monthly basis.

### D. Background on Recommended Contractor

The recommended firm, L&R Auto Parks DBA Joe's Auto Parks (Joe's Auto Parks), located in Los Angeles, CA, has been in business for over 60 years. Joe's Auto Parks' relationships include a 24-year contract for the parking operations at JFK Airport and a 24-year contract for the parking operations for the county of Los

Angeles, as large as 58 parking facilities and over 30,000 parking spaces. Joe's Auto Parks operates more than 100 facilities nationwide. This portfolio of properties annually collects more than \$120 million in parking receipts.

The proposed team is composed of Joe's Auto Parks and four subcontractors, including Park Consulting, a Metro certified SBE. The proposed team is experienced in managing large-scale parking facilities and the proposed project manager is a 15-year veteran of the parking industry. The proposed project manager's experience includes retail businesses such as The Beverly Center in Los Angeles and City Place in Long Beach, as well as overseeing municipality locations for the City of Long Beach including the Aquarium of the Pacific Parking garage. Currently, Joe's Auto Parks is the parking operator for Metro's parking facilities along Metro's transit corridors and has performed satisfactorily.