

**Implementation Plan for the FY 2010-2012 Triennial Review
Of the Los Angeles County Transit Operators**

ANTELOPE VALLEY TRANSIT AUTHORITY

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Submit all Transit Operator Financial Transaction Reports to the State Controller within the PUC-established timeframe.	Rong Fitzgibbons / Colby Konisek	We have submitted all State Controllers Reports by the PUC-established timeframe for the past 3 fiscal years.	FY 2011
2	Submit all financial audits within the PUC-established timeframe.	Colby Konisek	We have submitted all audits by the PUC-established timeframe for the past 3 fiscal years.	FY 2011
3	Calculate the Full-Time Equivalents metric according to PUC definition (labor hours divided by 2,000) for reporting on Transit Operators Financial Transaction Report fillings to the State Controller.	Rong Fitzgibbons / Colby Konisek	In FY 2010, we incorrectly used the federal definition of 2,080 labor hours for reporting, however, the last 2 fiscal years we have used the state law definition of 2,000 for reporting on Transit Operators Financial Transaction Report fillings to the State Controller.	FY 2012

ARCADIA TRANSIT

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Redesign the City's service delivery model as a traditional two-tiered (fixed route and demand-response) transit system.	City of Arcadia	Conduct Needs Assessment and Restructuring Plan (RFP in process) Implement recommended service delivery modes	9/30/15 7/1/16
2	Develop and implement a formal marketing program to support the new service delivery model.	City of Arcadia	Develop and implement marketing program as part of the Restructuring Plan	4/1/16

3	Enhance security measures at operations contractor's counting room.	Contractor	The Fare Counting Room is a locked room with very limited access only by the fare counting personnel and the Vice President/COO. The room is also equipped with a money counter and has a continuously recording camera to observe all activities taking place inside the room.	May 2013
4	Develop a formal customer feedback/complaint process.	City of Arcadia/ Contractor	A complaint form and a formal process have long been established. The City and the contractor continue to follow the procedure for complaints that are significant.	On-going
5	Work with the operations contractor to ensure inspections and vehicle maintenance of its fleet are systematically conducted at regular intervals and vehicle records are signed and include necessary vehicle information	Contacto r/City of Arcadia	This program has been implemented as of July 1, 2014 with the award of our new contract.	7/1/14

CLAREMONT DIAL-A-RIDE

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Develop and implement a formal marketing program.	George Sparks/Cari Sneed	The City reviewed the impact of the fare increase on DAR. Staff will be evaluating the development of recommendations for a targeted marketing effort to increase productivity and utilization of the Group service.	Fall 2014
2	Hire an outside consultant to conduct performance assessments.	George Sparks/Cari Sneed	Claremont will hire a consultant to prepare an overall service assessment that will be incorporated into the FY2016 SRTP.	Fall 2015
3	Secure cash-handling facility when counting group-ride fares.	George Sparks/Cari Sneed	This recommendation was satisfied with the relocation of the DAR operations facility. The new facility provides a safe cash-handling facility.	Completed January 2014
4	Invest in data management software to compile all performance data reported within Transit Performance Measurement, National Transit	George Sparks/Cari Sneed	The consultant that will assist with the preparation of the 2016 SRTP will also provide recommendations to satisfy this recommendation.	Fall 2015

	Database, and Transit Operators Financial Transaction Reports.			
--	--	--	--	--

COMMERCE MUNICIPAL BUS LINES

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Submit fiscal audits in a timely manner.	Loan Le & Josh Brooks	Recommendations were implemented to ensure timely reporting.	July 2012 Achieved
2	Properly calculate FTE for inclusion in the Transit Operators Financial Transaction Report.	Loan Le & Josh Brooks	Steps are being taken to implement the recommended FTE calculation method for State Controller reporting purposes.	July 2013 Achieved
3	Enhance program promotion through development of a strategic marketing plan with a five-year horizon.	Claude McFerguson	The City is currently installing a brand new ITS System, which the capabilities of “real time” arrival times, bus routing information and interactive website to help better market system.	The ITS RFP is currently posted with a bid deadline of 7/29/2015. Contract award to proceed immediately
4	Identify sustainable program with a five-year horizon.	Claude McFerguson	The City is currently implementing its five year horizon plan. Completion date approximately December 2014.	December 2014 Achieved
5	Improve the consistency of data reported to each external entity.	Claude McFerguson, Loan Le & Josh Brooks	Recommendations were implemented to ensure timely reporting.	July 2012

CULVER CITY MUNICIPAL BUS LINES

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Properly calculate FTE for inclusion in the Transit Operators Financial Transaction Report.	D. Chang and J. Leonard	Report FTE by calculating employee hours divided by 2,000, rather than using actual person count.	FY12-13

FOOTHILL TRANSIT

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Improve the consistency of performance data reported within the National Transit Database (NTD), Transit Performance Measurement (TPM), and Transit Operators Financial Transaction (TOR) Reports.	Michelle Caldwell/Gil Victorio	The financial information contained in the TPM is in agreement with the annual financial audit (AKA General Ledger/State Controller's report). This will ensure Foothill Transit achieves consistency in reporting.	April 2013

GARDENA MUNICIPAL BUS LINES

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Work with auditor so that CAFRs are submitted within the PUC-established timeframe.	Raphael Guillen	Submittals have been prepared on-time and within PUC-established timeframe	Completed
2	Maintain documentation regarding requests for extensions when CAFRs must be submitted late.	Raphael Guillen	Submittals have been prepared on-time; CAFR has been submitted on time per reporting requirements and extensions are no longer being requested	Completed
	The City should strive to improve its fixed-route farebox recovery to the point where auxiliary revenue is not necessary to meet the TDA minimum standard.	Raphael Guillen	In an effort to increase the farebox recovery rate, a fare increase is being considered by GMBL for possible FY 2016 implementation. A comprehensive marketing campaign was implemented in January 2015 including a full system rebrand with a goal of 5% ridership increase by year end 2016. GMBL continues to strive to reduce operating costs including overhead, overtime, spread time, etc.	2015
	Improve the consistency of data reported to each external entity.	Raphael Guillen	GMBL is exploring the acquisition of a statistical software application to assist with data collection and reporting requirements	Winter 2014
	Develop and implement marketing plan to reverse declining ridership trend.	Raphael Guillen	A marketing plan has been developed to celebrate the 75th anniversary of GMBL; implementation started in Fall 2014 and will carry into 2015	Marketing plan completed. Implementation strategies

				underway; Full launch in January 2015; soft launch starts Fall 2014.
--	--	--	--	--

LA MIRADA TRANSIT

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Include accurate FTE data within Transit Operators Financial Transaction Reports.	Tony Moreno	The City will submit Full Time Equivalent (FTE) data based on 2,000 hours equaling 1 FTE staff in the Transit Operators Financial Transaction Report for FY 2013/14. FTE calculations for TPM reports in 2012/13 will include contractor hours in the FTE calculation.	October 2014
2	Improve the accuracy of data included within the Transit Operations Financial Transaction Reports.	Judy Quinonez	The Transit Operations Final Transaction report is now reviewed jointly by the Transit administration and finance staff prior to submission to the State Controller's Office to ensure the correct data is accurate. Additionally, previous inconsistencies in reporting have been corrected and submitted to the State Controller's office. Inconsistencies specific to Vehicle Service Hours were correctly entered in the FY 12/13 Transit Operations Financial Transaction Report. Vehicle Service Miles and Full-Time Equivalent consistent indicators will be included in the FY 13/14 Transit Operations Financial Transaction Report consistent with PUC guidelines.	October 2014
3	Implement a fare increase	Tony Moreno	Staff is hiring a consultant to analyze the impacts of a fare increase. Staff plans to bring a recommendation to City Council in late 2015 for a fare increase.	To Be Determined
4	Develop and implement an 18-to 24- month marketing plan to support increase in ridership and fare revenue	Tony Moreno	Staff is hiring a consultant to review the effectiveness and make recommendations on implementation of a marketing plan.	February 2015

5	Install fareboxes and revise fare collection policies.	Tony Moreno	Farebox quotes have been obtained. Staff plans to purchase diamond fare boxes in the near future.	November 2014
---	--	-------------	---	---------------

LONG BEACH TRANSIT

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	No findings			

LADOT

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Submit all Transit Operator Financial Transaction Reports to the State Controller within the PUC-established timeframe.	LADOT	State Controller reports (inclusive of correct FTE data) should be filed prior to the submittal deadline stipulated by the PUC. FTE data, calculated correctly, should be included.	FY 12/13
2	Submit all financial audits within the PUC-established timeframe.	LADOT	Submit all compliance audits (CAFRS) to the State Controller within the PUC-established time frame. (180 days after end of fiscal year) PFP is to work with independent auditor to ensure they are aware of the (differing) TDA deadline. If deadline cannot be met, LADOT will request 90-day extensions and document whether the request was granted so that we can be found in compliance in the next review.	FY 12/13
3	Ensure data reported to external entities are accurately calculated and reported, as well as includes all required performance—related data.	LADOT	The PFP is to keep track of when various reports are filed, to submit them on time (with unaudited or incomplete data) and amend them as necessary once the data is finalized. Both original State Controller filings as well as revised data pages should be provided in entirety, including all pages and data not usually reported to Metro.	FY 12/13

METRO

Ref	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility	Plan for Progress	Implementation
------------	-----------------------------	-----------------------	--------------------------	-----------------------

No.		Lead/Support	Implementation Instruments	Date
1	Properly calculate FTE data for inclusion in the Transit Operators Financial Transaction Report.	Alex Perez	All subsequent reports will include the purchase transportation data.	7/1/14
2	Include representation from metro's Accounting staff in subsequent Triennial Performance Review	Alex Perez	An Accounting staff representative will be available for future Triennial Performance Reviews.	7/1/14

MONTEBELLO BUS LINES

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Submit all Transit Fund financial audit reports prior to the deadline established by PUC guidelines.	David Kim	Montebello Bus Lines will continue to submit the Transit Financial Audit Report and the State Controller's Report to the appropriate agencies within the established timeframe. Should there be any delays in reporting, a prior extension or approval will be requested from the agency.	Effective FY 2012/2013 reporting period
2	Include contractor hours when reporting FTE employee data to the State Controller.	Robert Portillo	The city will continue to calculate the Full-Time Equivalent using all employee hours when reporting to State Controller.	Effective FY 2012/2013 reporting period
	Utilize a single database for the collection of data and cross-check reports to all three entities (LACMA,NTD, and the State Controller) to ensure they are consistently reported.	Robert Portillo	Montebello Bus Lines will verify and ensure all future data reporting are consistent with the three reporting entities. Furthermore, we will improve our process by consistently verifying our data in our current database, TransTrack.	Effective FY 2012/2013 reporting period

NORWALK TRANSIT

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Include contractor hours when calculating FTE employee data	Theresa Clark	Established a separate spreadsheet to track contractor hours which is linked to the Master FTE File used for populating data for TPM, NTD, etc.	July 1, 2012

2	Develop and implement a five-year marketing plan focused on expanding the traditional transit rider customer base as part of an effort to increase ridership and fare revenue.	Theresa Clark/Graham Ridley	Developing student customer focus strategies with local Community Colleges including on-going Go Rio Student Pass MOU with Rio Hondo College and implementation of FY2015 Student Pass Program with Cerritos Community College. NTS utilizes the Comprehensive Operational Analysis on a triennial basis to evaluate its performance. Recommendations from the 2012 COA were implemented to restore mid-day service on segment(s) for Route 3 allowing the service to be more utilized by dependent riders. Additionally, NTS is developing an Intelligent Transportation System to improve customer service, overall bus efficiency and identify potential unmet rider needs. The system will include: Automatic Vehicle Location; Automated Passenger Count with real-time reporting; GPS based Computer Automated Dispatch system; Automated Vehicle Annunciator System and Automated Travel Information System. Lastly, NTS developed a new fare structure for its Fixed-Route and Dial-A-Ride services. The new fare structure was implemented in (2) phases; effective 11/20/2011, and 11/17/2013.	November 20, 2011 and September 9, 2012 and November 17, 2013 and ongoing
	Improve the accuracy of performance data reported within the Transit Operators Financial Transaction Reports (TOR).	Theresa Clark/Sudesh Paul	Adherence to consistent cut-off dates for financial reporting and cross-reference reconciliation performed through use of spreadsheets.	July 1, 2013
	Track trip denials for Norwalk Transit System's Dial-A-Ride service.	Theresa Clark/Maria Corona	Trip denials are recorded by Contractor utilizing Computer Aided Dispatch. Also, Customer Service Representatives (Lobby Staff) receives calls from patrons that were unable to receive DAR service for specific pick-up time and are entered into database (Access) for tracking, then a customer comment report is generated and followed up for appropriate action and/or resolution by Staff/Management	July 1, 2013
	Streamline the definition of "senior" so the same metric applies to both fixed-route and demand-response services.	Graham Ridley	The "senior" age requirement for demand-response was formerly consistent with Fixed Route at 62 yrs of age. However, local policy administered by the City reduced the "senior" age requirement to 60 yrs of age in support of Senior Center/Social Services Programs; thus NTS' demand-response service (age	FY 2014/15

			<p>requirement) is compatible with the eligibility age requirements for various Senior Community Services Programs.</p> <p>NTS' next COA is scheduled for September 2015. At which time, the scope of services will cover a cost analysis to determine potential impacts to fare revenue if "senior" age for fixed route is reduced to 60 yrs of age.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--

CITY OF REDONDO BEACH

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Implement the Beach Cities Transit marketing plan developed in November 2011	Joyce Rooney/Diane Amaya	Hired a transit consultant to assist with Transit Marketing. Implementing new brochures, and new transit signage. Other items are in the planning phase.	In progress
2	File a separate Transit Operators Financial Transaction Report (TOR) for the City's Specialized Service (demand-response taxi program).	Joyce Rooney/Diane Amaya	The separate FY13 TOR demand response dial a ride service report was submitted in October 2013. Separate reports will be submitted in the future.	Completed TOR is due to the State in October 2015.
3	Report data consistently on all filings with reporting entities.	Joyce Rooney/Diane Amaya	Staff reviews all reporting statistics for consistency.	On-going
4	Improve security at the City's transit maintenance and storage facility.	Joyce Rooney	<p>The facility driveway gate is locked by closing supervisor leaving the premises after everyone leaves. The lead mechanic unlocks the gate in the morning. The gate is left open during the day due to the number of vehicles entering and exiting the yard.</p> <p>The office door is locked after hours, and only 7 personnel have keys. The maintenance doors are locked when there is no mechanic on duty. The gate between the office and shop is also locked during these times.</p> <p>There is one camera outside the front office door that captures anyone entering the office, driver's area and maintenance / supervisor and securement area.</p>	Completed

			<p>There are three cameras inside the office area, and one in the Dispatch office to monitor the counting of the fare revenue is counted.</p> <p>Blinds were installed in the Dispatch area and are these closed during the money counting process. All blinds are closed and doors and windows are secured during this process.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--

SANTA CLARITA TRANSIT

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Submit all Transit Operator Financial Transaction Reports to the State Controller within the PUC-established timeframe.	Susan Lipman and Brittany Houston	The final report indicated that no further action was required as the City continues to submit all SCO Reports on time.	On-going
	Submit all financial audits within the PUC-established timeframe.	Susan Lipman and Brittany Houston	City staff continues to work with annual audit team to complete the Transit portion of the audit in a timely manner.	On-going
	Ensure data is reported accurately and consistently to all reporting entities.	Susan Lipman	Staff continues to work with city financial staff and annual auditors to help make sure that data is 100% accurate and not subject to change when staff prepares and submits reports due with different deadlines. Staff will continue to review reports for consistency and if changes are made staff will work more diligently to submit revised reports.	On-going

SANTA MONICA'S BIG BLUE BUS

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Ensure FTE reporting complies with PUC 99247(j)	Enny Chung	Policy created to ensure FTE reporting complies with PUC 99247(j)	7/1/2013

TORRANCE TRANSIT

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	The City should strive to improve its fixed-route farebox recovery to the point where auxiliary revenue is not necessary to meet the TDA minimum standard.	Jim Mills	The City will strive to improve its fixed route farebox recovery with the following strategies: 1) Reduce its operating cost as much as possible 2) Increase its marketing efforts to increase ridership 3) Consider a fare increase.	07/01/14
	Improve the consistency of performance data reported within the National Transit Database (NTD), Transit Performance Measurement (TPM), and Transit Operators Financial Transaction (TOR) Reports.	Jim Mills	All data has been incorporated into a central file (spreadsheet). Data is compared and reviewed by relevant section to ensure accuracy and consistency.	07/01/13

**FY 2010-2012 Triennial Review Implementation Plan for Los Angeles County
Metropolitan Authority (LACMTA) as Regional Transportation Planning Entity (RTPE)**

Ref No.	Audit Recommendation	Responsibility Lead/Support	Plan for Progress Implementation Instruments	Implementation Date
1	Monitor operators to ensure future fiscal audits are submitted by the stipulated deadline.	MASD	MASD monitors and work with Project Manager and SCO to ensure timely submittal of fiscal audits.	2014
2	Provide a higher level of administrative support for operators regarding annual and required reporting.	Local Programming	Annually, Metro submits a consolidated NTD report to Federal Transit Administration (FTA) on behalf of Los Angeles county transit operators. This report is coordinated with approximately 48 jurisdictions. Throughout the year, NTD training workshops are conducted to train new reporters/staff and provide updates on reporting requirements to existing reporters and prepare the reporters for their annual audit. At the end of fiscal year each jurisdictions' annual NTD reports is collected which include their ridership, financial, fuel consumption and inventory data to ensure and validate the consistency of the reported data with NTD reporting requirements.	On-going
3	Provide a higher level of support for operators in advance of the next Triennial Performance Review cycle.	Local Programming	To be implemented during the 2013-2015 Triennial Review cycle	July/Sept 2015
4	Enhance coordination between the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) and Planning departments.	Regional Transit Planning	Regional Transit Planning is currently working with the municipal operators and a consultant team on the development of a Regional Short Range Transit Plan (RSRTP). As part of this effort, one of the findings and/or recommendations is looking at streamlining the annual individual Short Range Transit Plan submittal process. As part of this, Metro would supply the operators with improved templates/guidelines for developing their SRTPS in order to improve on the consistency and quality of the contents. It is also being recommended that annual SRTP training be provided for newer staff at the various agencies.	To be determined based on discussions and approval by BOS. It most likely would not be implemented until late 2016.