

PROCUREMENT SUMMARY
OPERATION AND MAINTENANCE OF COMPRESSED NATURAL GAS FUELING
STATIONS AT DIVISIONS 1, 3, 5, 7, 10 & 18/OP749030003367

1.	Contract Number: OP749030003367	
2.	Recommended Vendor: Clean Energy	
3.	Type of Procurement (check one): <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input type="checkbox"/> IFB-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order	
4.	Procurement Dates:	
	A. Issued: April 7, 2021	
	B. Advertised/Publicized: April 7, 2021	
	C. Pre-proposal/Pre-Bid Conference: April 19, 2021	
	D. Proposals/Bids Due: June 1, 2021	
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: July 14, 2021	
	F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics: June 8, 2021	
	G. Protest Period End Date: November 22, 2021	
5.	Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded: 11	Bids Received: 2
6.	Contract Administrator: Aielyn Dumaua	Telephone Number: (213) 922-7320
7.	Project Manager: Christopher Limon	Telephone Number: (213) 922-6637

A. Procurement Background

This Board Action is to approve the award of OP749030003367 to Clean Energy, to provide comprehensive operations and maintenance services for compressed natural gas (CNG) fueling stations at Divisions 1, 3, 5, 7, 10 and 18. Board approval of contract award is subject to resolution of all properly submitted protest(s).

On April 7, 2021, Request for Proposals (RFP) No. OP74903 was issued as a competitive procurement in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy. The proposed contract type is firm fixed unit rate. The Diversity and Economic Opportunity Department (DEOD) did not recommend a Small Business Enterprise (SBE) and Disabled Veteran Business Enterprise (DVBE) participation goal due to lack of subcontracting opportunities.

Two amendments were issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on May 19, 2021, extended the proposal due date.
- Amendment No. 2, issued on May 24, 2021, clarified the scope of services and replaced the schedule of quantities and prices form.

A virtual pre-proposal conference was held on April 19, 2021. Worksite visits were also conducted on April 20 and 21, 2021. There were no questions received prior to the proposal due date.

A total of eleven firms downloaded the RFP and were included on the planholders' list. Two proposals were received by the due date of June 1, 2021 and are listed below in alphabetical order:

1. Clean Energy
2. Trillium Transportation Fuels, LLC

B. Evaluation of Proposals

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Facilities Contracted Maintenance Services, Environmental Compliance/Sustainability and Facilities/Property Maintenance Departments were convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received.

Proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria stated in the RFP:

- Qualifications of the Firm/Team 15 percent
- Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel 20 percent
- Management Plan/Approach 35 percent
- Cost Proposal 30 percent

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for similar operations and maintenance services procurements. Several factors were considered in developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to the management plan/approach.

On June 2, 2021, the PET met to review the evaluation criteria package, process confidentiality and conflict of interest forms and take receipt of the two proposals to initiate the evaluation phase. Evaluations were conducted from June 2, 2021 through June 18, 2021.

On June 18, 2021, the PET reconvened and determined that both proposals were technically acceptable and fell within the competitive range.

On June 25, 2021, oral presentations were held with both firms. The project managers and key team members from each firm were invited to present their firm's respective qualifications and respond to the PET's questions. At the conclusion of the oral presentations, Clean Energy was determined to be the highest rated firm.

Qualifications Summary of Firms Within the Competitive Range:

Clean Energy

Clean Energy has provided CNG station maintenance services for high volume transit agencies since 1996. It currently operates 80 natural gas fueling stations for transit agencies. Existing customers include LACMTA, New York MTA, Foothill

Transit, Orange County Transit Authority, Santa Monica Big Blue Bus, Dallas Area Rapid Transit, Phoenix Transit, New Jersey Transit, Jacksonville Transportation Authority, NICE Bus (Nassau County, New York) and Washington Metro Area Transportation Authority.

Trillium Transportation Fuels, LLC

Trillium Transportation Fuels, LLC is headquartered in Houston, Texas and has over 27 years of experience designing, building, operating, and maintaining high volume, public transit CNG fueling facilities. Existing clients include Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA), San Diego Metropolitan Transit System (MTS), Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority (MBTA), New York City Transit (MTA), Pennsylvania Department of Transportation (PennDOT), North County Transit District (NCTD), Regional Transportation Commission of Southern Nevada (RTC) and Miami-Dade County.

The following is a summary of the PET scores:

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	Clean Energy				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	81.53	15.00%	12.23	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	81.90	20.00%	16.38	
5	Management Plan/Approach	79.00	35.00%	27.65	
6	Cost Proposal	100.00	30.00%	30.00	
7	Total		100.00%	86.26	1
8	Trillium Transportation Fuels, LLC				
9	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	78.00	15.00%	11.70	
10	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	77.50	20.00%	15.50	
11	Management Plan/Approach	76.51	35.00%	26.78	
12	Cost Proposal	96.47	30.00%	28.94	
13	Total		100.00%	82.92	2

C. Cost/Price Analysis

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, technical analysis, and fact-finding. The recommended price is lower than Metro’s independent cost estimate (ICE).

PROPOSER	AMOUNT	METRO ICE	AWARD AMOUNT
1. Clean Energy	\$10,908,723	\$16,539,927	\$10,908,723
2. Trillium Transportation Fuels, LLC	\$11,307,445		

D. Background on Recommended Contractor

The recommended firm, Clean Energy, located in Newport Beach, CA, was established in 1996. It is a renewable natural gas distribution company that also designs, builds, operates, and maintains fueling stations; sells and services compressors and other equipment that are used in fueling stations; and provides assessment, design, and modification solutions to offer operators with code-compliant service and maintenance facilities for natural gas vehicle fleets.

Clean Energy currently employs over 190 trained, and certified service technicians on call 24/7/365, including 30 in Southern California.

Clean Energy has been providing comprehensive operations and maintenance services for compressed natural gas (CNG) fueling stations to Metro since 2010 and performance has been satisfactory.

Clean Energy's proposed Project Manager has more than 35 years of experience leading teams that operate and maintain specialized industrial equipment. He is the project manager of the current contract.