

1. Executive Summary

The Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority (Metro) contracts with the Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department (LASD) to provide Metro with transit policing services. The current annualized cost of the transit policing contract is \$108.5 million.¹ Metro will soon be developing a Request for Proposal (RFP) for a new contract, and needs an in-depth analysis to identify staffing and deployment requirements for the RFP.

The primary objective of this analysis was to perform an analysis of the law enforcement and security workload, identify key risks for the Metro System, identify risk mitigation strategies, and identify staffing needs and staffing options.

For Metro's safety and security services to be effective and cost efficient, there must be an appropriate match between the safety and security mission and the various resources used to provide safety and security services. The key services required as part of the Metro safety and security mission are:

- **Addressing Crime and Responding to Calls for Service or Incidents** requires sworn law enforcement officers who have full powers to detain and arrest and to use force as required to provide this mission element.
- **Providing a Visible Security Presence** on the Metro System as a deterrent to crime and disorder, as well as other critical incidents like terrorist attacks. This service could be provided by law enforcement personnel, but may also be provided by well-trained and well-managed security personnel.
- **Enforcing Fare Compliance** on the Metro System, as well as enforcing Metro's customer code of conduct. Providing this service does not require law enforcement sworn personnel or security personnel.
- **Protecting Metro Critical Infrastructure** (Union Station and the Gateway Metro Headquarters Building) Union Station protection strategies include routine patrol, K9 explosives detection, and random passenger and baggage screenings currently conducted by law enforcement personnel. The Gateway Building security is currently provided through armed security officers at the security desk on the plaza level and third floor, loading dock, roving security officers in both the interior and exterior of the building, the Transit Court, and the Security Control Room. Providing critical infrastructure protection of the Gateway Metro Headquarters Building is a security function, and does not require law enforcement personnel.
- **Providing Security for Metro Facilities and Operations** through security units that patrol the various Metro facilities and provide a visible security presence for those facilities. In addition, Metro revenue operations security and protection provided through security

¹ The annualized cost includes full-year costs for the 2016 expansion of the Metro Expo and Gold lines.

escorts of Metro revenue collection personnel, and security presence in the Metro cash counting facility. Security personnel also provide a visible security presence and deterrent to assaults or other actions against Metro pressure washer personnel that clean various Metro stations and facilities during the overnight hours. Providing security for Metro facilities and operations is a security function, and does not require law enforcement personnel.

The resources available to Metro to provide the elements of Metro's safety and security mission described above include:

- **LASD Transit Policing Division (TPD)** has established a strong partnership with Metro and currently provides sworn law enforcement personnel to fulfill the safety and security mission of the Metro rail and bus system. These law enforcement personnel are fully trained and equipped and have powers to detain and arrest and use force as needed. They are currently responsible for responding to incidents and calls for service, addressing crime and related issues, and providing a visible security presence throughout the Metro Rail and Bus System. These law enforcement personnel are also responsible for enforcing fare compliance and the Metro customer code of conduct throughout the System.

The TPD also provides uniformed Security Assistants (SA's) to Metro under contract. These SA's are not sworn personnel, nor are they qualified or certified as security personnel. The SA's are not armed and have no authority to detain or arrest. The role of the SA's is limited to checking fare compliance and issuing administrative citations.

The LASD also employs Sheriff Security Officers (SSO's) that are uniformed and armed or unarmed security personnel. These personnel do not have the powers to detain and arrest nor use force except in a defensive mode. The TPD and the current Metro contract do not currently include any such SSO's, who are a potential resource option to provide the security element of Metro's safety and security mission.

- **Local Law Enforcement Agencies** throughout the Metro service area respond to and handle incidents and calls for service within their jurisdiction, and have a responsibility to do so. This is part of their basic service as law enforcement agencies. Similarly, these agencies have a responsibility to provide these same basic services to Metro buses and trains within their jurisdictions consistent with the service provided to all others within their jurisdictions. Metro should not have to contract with these agencies for these basic services, but may choose to contract for dedicated or supplemental resources from local law enforcement agencies.
- **Metro Security** includes uniformed and armed or unarmed security personnel primarily responsible for providing security for the Gateway Metro Headquarters Building, and for Metro facilities and operations. Metro Security officers are neither sworn nor certified law enforcement officers and do not have the authority to detain or arrest nor use force except in a defensive mode. Metro Security personnel could potentially play a substantial role on the Metro rail and bus systems by providing the security element of

the Metro safety and security mission. However, several key issues must be resolved prior to assuming such a role. The primary need is to resolve ongoing questions regarding the authority these security personnel have, and the entity or agency responsible for granting and overseeing that authority. Metro also contracts for private security personnel.

The following exhibit shows the estimated annual hours required to provide each key safety and security service by category (e.g. rail system, bus system, etc.). It also shows the average hourly cost of the different options of personnel types or resources available that could provide the service required. These costs, and the estimated hours required, were used to calculate the annual costs of providing these services using each of the alternative resources. A mix of these personnel could also be used to provide the services.

Exhibit 1								
Summary Overview of Metro Safety and Security Services, Estimated Hours Required, and Options for Providing Services								
		LASD Transit Policing Division			Local LE Agencies		Metro Security	
	Estimated Hours Required	Law Enforcement	Security Officers	Security Assistants	Basic Service	Dedicated Service	Armed Security Officers	Unarmed Security Officers
Average Hourly Cost		\$129.86	\$84.47	\$33.34	\$0.00	TBD	\$64.04	\$49.23
Rail System Protection	Hours	Estimated Annual Costs in Millions						
Crime / Calls for Service	108,404	\$14.0	NA	NA	\$0.0	TBD	NA	NA
Visible Security Presence	327,040	\$42.5	\$27.6	NA	NA	TBD	\$20.9	NA
Fare Enforcement	186,880	NA	\$15.8	\$6.2	NA	TBD	NA	\$9.2
Bus System Protection								
Crime / Calls for Service	169,360	\$22.0	NA	NA	\$0.0	TBD	NA	NA
Visible Security Presence	153,058	\$19.9	\$12.9	NA	NA	TBD	\$9.8	NA
Investigations and Special Operations *								
Investigations	32,202	\$4.2	NA	NA	\$0.0	TBD	NA	NA
Special Operations	41,505	\$5.4	NA	NA	NA	TBD	NA	NA
Mental Evaluation Team	7,156	\$0.9	NA	NA	NA	TBD	NA	NA
Critical Infrastructure Protection								
High Visibility Patrol	25,680	\$3.3	NA	NA	NA	TBD	NA	NA
K9 Explosives Detection	8,760	\$1.1	NA	NA	NA	TBD	NA	NA
Passenger Screening	16,320	\$2.1	\$1.4	NA	NA	TBD	\$1.0	NA
Gateway Bldg. Security	63,808	NA	\$5.4	NA	NA	TBD	\$4.1	NA
Metro Facilities and Operations Security								
Mobile Security Units	46,720	NA	\$3.9	NA	NA	NA	\$3.0	NA
Revenue Operations	75,920	NA	\$6.4	NA	NA	NA	\$4.9	NA
Pressure Washer Escort	17,520	NA	\$1.5	NA	NA	NA	\$1.1	NA
NA – Not applicable, this service cannot be provided by the resource in that column.								
TBD – To Be Determined, the cost for dedicated service by local law enforcement agencies will be determined through the Request for Proposal process.								
* Hours for investigations and special operations are based on the current number of FTE deputies assigned.								

The estimated staffing needs detailed above were developed based on our review and analysis of the following:

- ***Descriptive and Operational Information*** including the number of stations, one-way miles, train and bus start and end times, average daily ridership, peak trains and buses in service, train and bus revenue hours, and train and bus revenue miles.
- ***Rail and Bus System Risks*** including violent crime, property crime, and other crime on the system by rail line or bus line and area. It also includes the public's perception of safety on the system. The level of fare compliance or evasion was also considered.
- ***Rail and Bus System Safety and Security Workload and Performance*** including responding to and handling incidents that occur on the system, or calls for service. Responding to these calls and effectively handling the incidents that generate these calls is a high priority for ensuring system safety and security. We analyzed the number of calls for service by rail line and bus line and area; and by priority, calls by day of week and time of day, the average amount of time required to dispatch calls for service, as well as the average amount of time required to respond to these calls.
- ***Current Rail and Bus System Protection Approach*** including the number of personnel currently deployed to provide safety and security on each rail line and bus line and area, and the total cost of these personnel.
- ***Current Critical Infrastructure and Metro Facilities and Operations Protection Approach*** including the number of personnel currently deployed to provide security on each within Union Station, the Gateway Building, throughout Metro's facilities and operations, and the total cost of these personnel.

Detailed information on each of these factors by rail line and bus line and area is presented in the body of this report.

The following table shows the recommendations made throughout the body of this report. This report was provided to management of the Systems Safety and Law Enforcement Division who reviewed the draft report and did not have any modifications. Management stated that the report recommendations are under review, and they are in the process of drafting a formal response.

Exhibit 2			
Summary or Recommendations and Metro's Response			
No.	Recommendation	Metro's Response	Comments
1.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should assist the Transit Policing Working Group established by the Metro Board, to use the information on risks, workload, staffing estimates and options outlined in this report to move forward with implementing staffing and deployment consistent with the goals, key priorities, and key strategies established.	Under Review	
2.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should continue to monitor and track the various safety and security risks facing the Metro System, deploy personnel consistent with the information provided in this report, and make revisions in plans and operations as needed including deployment of personnel to mitigate these risks on an ongoing basis.	Under Review	
3.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should continue to collect information on risk mitigation strategies implemented by other transit safety and security operations and implement them for Metro as appropriate.	Under Review	
4.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should continue to maintain and build the strong partnership Metro has with the contract law enforcement service through increased planning and collaboration. Also, consider alternate mixes of contract law enforcement, security, and Metro Security personnel to optimally mitigate safety and security risks.	Under Review	
5.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should consider the types of duties described in this report that might be performed by the Metro Security personnel to better define their roles, and work to resolve ongoing questions regarding the authority of	Under Review	

No.	Recommendation	Metro's Response	Comments
	Metro Security personnel within their confines, and the entity or agency responsible for granting and overseeing that authority.		
6.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should continue to work with local law enforcement agencies to identify the potential for no cost basic services. Also consider if paid dedicated service from these agencies is beneficial and manageable, and leverage these services as appropriate. Efforts should also be made to increase regular communication and education to promote collaboration and coordination.	Under Review	
7.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should work with Metro Operations to identify the potential use of other Metro employees on the System, define their roles, create a plan of coordination and communication for seamless service, and evaluate the impact of these employees on System safety and security.	Under Review	
8.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should consider developing or acquiring and implementing a resource oversight and monitoring application for use on the smartphones currently used by Metro safety and security personnel. Metro should also consider identifying specific reporting requirements as input into the development of the new Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) system by the LASD.	Under Review	
9.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should review and discuss the rail system risks, current safety and security workload, estimated staffing needs, and options for providing rail protection services outlined in this report to develop the Request for Proposals for law enforcement and security services and to develop a Rail Safety and Security Plan.	Under Review	
10.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should consider these elements and review and discuss the bus system risks, current safety and security workload, estimated staffing needs, and options for	Under Review	

No.	Recommendation	Metro's Response	Comments
	providing bus protection services outlined in this report to develop the Request for Proposals for law enforcement and security services and to develop a Bus Safety and Security Plan.		
11.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should use the information obtained through the Request for Proposal for law enforcement and security services, and identify the level of and approach to investigative and special operations services as part of the Rail and Bus Safety and Security Plans.	Under Review	
12.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should use the information and options outlined in this report to develop a Request for Proposal for law enforcement and security services, and to develop a Critical Infrastructure Protection Plan.	Under Review	
13.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should use the information and options outlined in this report to develop a Metro and Operations Security Plan.	Under Review	
14.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should use the information obtained through the Transit Policing Division and Metro Security employee surveys to identify and address key issues.	Under Review	
15.	The Metro System Safety and Law Enforcement Division should continue to monitor progress made implementing the LASD Contract Audit and APTA Peer Review recommendations and continue to report progress to Metro management and the Board. Where appropriate, recommendations should be considered in developing the Request for Proposals for law enforcement and security services.	Under Review	