

PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

LANDSCAPE AND IRRIGATION MAINTENANCE SERVICES / OP91244-20008370 and OP91244-20018370

1.	<b>Contract Number:</b> OP91244-20008370 (Region 1 & 2) OP91244-20018370 (Region 3)	
2.	<b>Recommended Vendor:</b> Woods Maintenance Services, Inc. (Region 1 & 2) Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc. (Region 3)	
3.	<b>Type of Procurement (check one):</b> <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order	
4.	<b>Procurement Dates:</b>	
	<b>A. Issued:</b> June 20, 2023	
	<b>B. Advertised/Publicized:</b> June 20, 2023	
	<b>C. Pre-Proposal Conference:</b> June 29, 2023	
	<b>D. Proposals Due:</b> August 3, 2023	
	<b>E. Pre-Qualification Completed:</b> March 19, 2024 (Woods); Pending (Parkwood)	
	<b>F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics:</b> September 6, 2023	
	<b>G. Protest Period End Date:</b> May 20, 2024	
5.	<b>Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded:</b>  28	<b>Bids/Proposals Received:</b> 4 (Region 1) 4 (Region 2) 4 (Region 3)
6.	<b>Contract Administrator:</b> Marc Margoni	<b>Telephone Number:</b> 213-922-1304
7.	<b>Project Manager:</b> Rommel Hilario	<b>Telephone Number:</b> 213-922-6733

**A. Procurement Background**

This Board action is to approve the award of Contract No. OP91244-20008370 (Region 1 and 2) to Woods Maintenance Services, Inc. and Contract No. OP91244-20018370 (Region 3) to Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc., to provide landscape and irrigation maintenance services throughout Metro bus and rail facilities, active and inactive rights-of-way (IROW), Metro Park & Ride (P&R) Lots and Caltrans P&R Lots as needed. Board approval of contract awards is subject to the resolution of any properly submitted protest(s), if any.

The Request for Proposals (RFP) was originally issued on September 1, 2022 as a Medium Size Business Tier I Set Aside (MSZ-I) with an SBE goal of 25% and a DVBE goal of 3%. Metro received seven proposals for the regions combined and all proposals were deemed non-responsive to the MSZ-I program requirements or SBE and DVBE goals. Therefore, the RFP was canceled.

Prior to the re-issuance of the solicitation, Metro conducted two Metro Connect Industry Forum Outreach events on May 31, 2023, and June 14, 2023, which were attended by 52 individuals representing small and medium-sized firms. During the outreach events, staff provided an overview detailing the enhanced MSZ and SBE Program policies for competitively negotiated procurements. The event also informed the small business community of the upcoming contracting opportunity to increase

and promote small business participation.

On June 20, 2023, RFP No. OP91244-2 was issued as a competitive procurement in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is a firm-fixed unit rate. The RFP was issued with a 22% SBE goal and a 3% DVBE goal. Further, the solicitation was subject to the Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE), which gives eligible proposers 5% preference bonus points for utilizing local small business firms.

Landscape and irrigation maintenance services are among the services that are part of Metro's agency-wide strategy to provide partnering opportunities to community-based organizations (CBOs). The RFP encouraged potential proposers to work with CBOs that have direct experience, relationships, and expertise in the geographical locations where landscape and irrigation maintenance services shall be performed.

Six amendments were issued to this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on June 30, 2023, revised Region 1 List of Locations (Attachment A1) and Region 1 Schedule of Quantities and Prices (Exhibit 2) to add the Los Angeles Union Station as a service location;
- Amendment No. 2, issued on June 30, 2023, provided the prevailing wage/living wage information relevant to the RFP;
- Amendment No. 3, issued on July 13, 2023, extended the proposal due date;
- Amendment No. 4, issued on July 19, 2023, added two attachments to the Scope of Services: List of Facilities Certified by City of Los Angeles (Attachment G) and MOU Agreement Bike Path Licensing Agreement (Attachment J); and
- Amendment No. 5, issued on July 25, 2023, extended the proposal due date.
- Amendment No. 6, issued on January 9, 2024, revised the Schedule of Quantities for Region 1 to include irrigation controllers connectivity fees under the three-year based summary.

A virtual pre-proposal conference was held on June 29, 2023, with four participants in attendance representing four firms. There were 17 questions received, and responses were released prior to the proposal due date.

On August 3, 2023, Metro received a total of twelve proposals listed below in alphabetical order by region:

#### Region 1

1. Bread & Water Landscaping, LLC.
2. Far East Landscape and Maintenance, Inc.
3. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.
4. Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.

## Region 2

1. Bread & Water Landscaping, LLC.
2. Far East Landscape and Maintenance, Inc.
3. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.
4. Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.

## Region 3

1. Bread & Water Landscaping, LLC.
2. Far East Landscape and Maintenance, Inc.
3. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.
4. Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.

## **B. Evaluation of Proposals**

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro's Facilities Contracted Maintenance Services and Environmental Services was convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received for all three regions.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria.

Phase I Evaluation – Minimum Qualification Review: This is a pass/fail criteria. To be responsive to the RFP minimum qualification requirements, proposers must meet the following:

- a) Must have at least three years of experience performing landscaping and irrigation maintenance services;
- b) Must submit reference information;
- c) Must submit a report listing safety training that the Project Managers/Supervisors have received within the last three years; and
- d) Must submit a copy of the Proposer's/subcontractor's valid and active State of California C-27 Landscaping Contractors License.

Evaluations were conducted from October 23, 2023, through November 29, 2023.

For all three regions, the PET deemed all proposers responsive to the minimum qualification review.

Phase II – Technical Evaluation: Proposers that meet the Phase I Evaluation were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and weights:

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| • Qualifications of the Firm/Team                | 15% |
| • Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel | 20% |
| • Management Plan/Approach                       | 35% |
| • Cost Proposal                                  | 30% |

- Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points) 5%

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for similar procurements. Several factors were considered in developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to the management plan/approach.

The PET independently evaluated and scored the technical proposals and determined that Woods Maintenance Services, Inc. was the top ranked firm for Regions 1 and 2 and Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc. was the top-ranked firm for Region 3.

### **Qualifications Summary of Firms:**

#### **Bread & Water Landscaping, LLC**

Bread & Water Landscaping LLC (Bread & Water), located in Pacoima, CA, has been in business for over 4 years. It caters to both commercial and residential clients providing landscaping and weed abatement removal services, trash removal, illegal dumping cleanups, and graffiti removal. Bread & Water is a Metro-certified SBE firm and a DBE firm certified by the California Unified Certification Program (CUCP).

#### **Far East Landscape and Maintenance, Inc.**

Far East Landscape Maintenance, Inc. (Far East), headquartered in Van Nuys, CA, has been in business since 1987, servicing the Los Angeles, Ventura, and Orange County areas. It currently provides Metro with landscaping and irrigation maintenance services at the Metro Expo II/E Line and is the landscaping subcontractor for Metro's four regional contracts for landscaping and irrigation maintenance services and graffiti abatement. Performance has been satisfactory. Far East is a Metro-certified SBE firm, a minority business enterprise certified by the City of Los Angeles, a CUCP-certified DBE firm, and a Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE).

#### **Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.**

Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc., has been providing landscaping & irrigation maintenance, trash & vegetation removal and graffiti abatement services in the Los Angeles, Ventura and Orange County areas for over 55 years and has relevant public transit system experience. Its current clients include the City of Long Beach, Blue Line, the City of Irvine, the County of Los Angeles, the City of South Gate, and the City of Ventura.

#### **Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.**

Woods Maintenance Services, Inc. (Woods), has been in business for over 35 years. It provides graffiti removal, weed abatement, pressure washing, right-of-way clearance, landscape and irrigation maintenance services and homeless encampment clean up. Woods' clients include Metrolink, Orange County Transportation Authority, California Department of Transportation and the Los Angeles County Department of Public Works.

The following is a summary of the PET scores.

**Region 1**

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	<b>Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.</b>				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	89.00	15.00%	13.35	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	95.85	20.00%	19.17	
5	Management Plan/Approach	90.34	35.00%	31.62	
6	Cost Proposal	98.20	30.00%	29.46	
7	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5.00%	5.00	
8	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>98.60</b>	<b>1</b>
9	<b>Bread &amp; Water Landscaping, LLC</b>				
10	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	72.00	15.00%	10.80	
11	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	81.65	20.00%	16.33	
12	Management Plan/Approach	80.34	35.00%	28.12	
13	Cost Proposal	100.00	30.00%	30.00	
14	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5.00%	5.00	
15	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>90.25</b>	<b>2</b>
16	<b>Far East Landscape and Maintenance, Inc.</b>				
17	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	84.33	15.00%	12.65	
18	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	77.50	20.00%	15.50	
19	Management Plan/Approach	77.34	35.00%	27.07	
20	Cost Proposal	95.90	30.00%	28.77	
21	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5.00%	5.00	
22	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>88.99</b>	<b>3</b>
23	<b>Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.</b>				

24	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	92.33	15.00%	13.85	
25	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	92.50	20.00%	18.50	
26	Management Plan/Approach	91.00	35.00%	31.85	
27	Cost Proposal	82.53	30.00%	24.76	
28	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	0.00	5.00%	0.00	
29	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>88.96</b>	<b>4</b>

## **Region 2**

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	<b>Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.</b>				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	89.00	15.00%	13.35	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	95.85	20.00%	19.17	
5	Management Plan/Approach	90.34	35.00%	31.62	
6	Cost Proposal	91.27	30.00%	27.38	
7	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5.00%	5.00	
8	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>96.52</b>	<b>1</b>
9	<b>Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.</b>				
10	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	92.33	15.00%	13.85	
11	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	93.75	20.00%	18.75	
12	Management Plan/Approach	91.00	35.00%	31.85	
13	Cost Proposal	100.00	30.00%	30.00	
14	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	0.00	5.00%	0.00	
15	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>94.45</b>	<b>2</b>

<b>16</b>	<b>Far East Landscape and Maintenance, Inc.</b>				
<b>17</b>	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	84.33	15.00%	12.65	
<b>18</b>	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	79.60	20.00%	15.92	
<b>19</b>	Management Plan/Approach	76.66	35.00%	26.83	
<b>20</b>	Cost Proposal	93.07	30.00%	27.92	
<b>21</b>	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5.00%	5.00	
<b>22</b>	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>88.32</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>23</b>	<b>Bread &amp; Water Landscaping, LLC</b>				
<b>24</b>	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	72.00	15.00%	10.80	
<b>25</b>	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	81.65	20.00%	16.33	
<b>26</b>	Management Plan/Approach	80.00	35.00%	28.00	
<b>27</b>	Cost Proposal	90.20	30.00%	27.06	
<b>28</b>	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5.00%	5.00	
<b>29</b>	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>87.19</b>	<b>4</b>

### **Region 3**

<b>1</b>	<b>Firm</b>	<b>Average Score</b>	<b>Factor Weight</b>	<b>Weighted Average Score</b>	<b>Rank</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.</b>				
<b>3</b>	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	92.33	15%	13.85	
<b>4</b>	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	93.75	20%	18.75	
<b>5</b>	Management Plan/Approach	91.00	35%	31.85	
<b>6</b>	Cost Proposal	100.00	30%	30.00	
<b>7</b>	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	0.00	5%	00.00	
<b>8</b>	<b>Total</b>		<b>105.00%</b>	<b>94.45</b>	<b>1</b>

<b>9</b>	<b>Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.</b>				
<b>10</b>	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	89.00	15%	13.35	
<b>11</b>	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	95.85	20%	19.17	
<b>12</b>	Management Plan/Approach	90.34	35%	31.62	
<b>13</b>	Cost Proposal	72.63	30%	21.79	
<b>14</b>	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5%	5.00	
<b>15</b>	<b>Total</b>		<b>105%</b>	<b>90.93</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>16</b>	<b>Far East Landscape and Maintenance, Inc.</b>				
<b>17</b>	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	84.33	15%	12.65	
<b>18</b>	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	79.60	20%	15.92	
<b>19</b>	Management Plan/Approach	76.66	35%	26.83	
<b>20</b>	Cost Proposal	98.60	30%	29.58	
<b>21</b>	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5%	5.00	
<b>22</b>	<b>Total</b>		<b>105%</b>	<b>89.98</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>23</b>	<b>Bread &amp; Water Landscaping, LLC</b>				
<b>24</b>	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	72.00	15%	10.80	
<b>25</b>	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	81.65	20%	16.33	
<b>26</b>	Management Plan/Approach	79.66	35%	27.88	
<b>27</b>	Cost Proposal	71.77	30%	21.53	
<b>28</b>	Local Small Business Enterprise (LSBE) Preference Program (Bonus Points)	100.00	5%	5.00	
<b>29</b>	<b>Total</b>		<b>105%</b>	<b>81.54</b>	<b>4</b>



## C. Price Analysis

### Region 1

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, technical analysis, fact-finding and negotiations. Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.'s negotiated price is 12.38% lower than Metro's Independent Cost Estimate (ICE). Staff successfully negotiated a cost savings of \$15,480.

	<b>Proposer Name</b>	<b>Proposal Amount</b>	<b>Metro ICE</b>	<b>Recommended Amount</b>
1.	Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.	\$14,001,100	\$15,962,358	\$13,985,620
2.	Bread & Water Landscape, LLC	\$13,749,991		
3.	Far East Landscaping and Maintenance, Inc.	\$14,335,840		
4.	Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.	\$16,659,752		

### Region 2

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, technical analysis, fact-finding and negotiations. Staff successfully negotiated a cost savings of \$408,500.

	<b>Proposer Name</b>	<b>Proposal Amount</b>	<b>Metro ICE</b>	<b>Recommended Amount</b>
1.	Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.	\$16,173,500	\$12,906,157	\$15,765,000
2.	Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.	\$14,763,381		
3.	Far East Landscaping and Maintenance, Inc.	\$15,865,134		
4.	Bread & Water Landscape, LLC	\$16,368,800		

The contract amount recommended for award is ~22% above the ICE, reflecting actual current market conditions with the significantly escalated costs of fuel, equipment, and materials.

### Region 3

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, and technical analysis. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.'s price is 17.59% lower than Metro's ICE.

	<b>Proposer Name</b>	<b>Proposal Amount</b>	<b>Metro ICE</b>	<b>Recommended Amount</b>
1.	Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.	\$10,938,305	\$13,273,630	\$10,938,305
2.	Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.	\$15,056,300		
3.	Far East Landscaping and Maintenance, Inc.	\$11,092,653		
4.	Bread & Water Landscape, LLC	\$15,241,200		

#### **D. Background on Recommended Contractors**

##### Region 1 and Region 2

##### Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.

Woods Maintenance Services Inc. (Woods), founded in 1997, headquartered in North Hollywood, California, is a full-service trash, debris, and weed removal service company. It provides maintenance services for various city and county agencies and maintains everything from sidewalks and streets to flood control channels and railroad right of ways.

The Woods team includes two SBE firms and one DVBE firm.

Woods has been providing landscaping and irrigation maintenance, trash and vegetation removal, and graffiti abatement services to Metro since 2001 and performance has been satisfactory.

##### Regions 3

##### Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.

Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc. (Parkwood), founded in 1967, is headquartered in Van Nuys, California, and has satellite offices in Bellflower, Long Beach, El Segundo, Alhambra, Lancaster and Garden Grove. Parkwood has been providing landscaping and irrigation maintenance services to Metro since 2015 and performance has been satisfactory.

The Parkwood team includes one SBE firm and one DVBE firm. Both subcontractors have experience providing landscaping and irrigation maintenance services to Metro and performance has been satisfactory.