



PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

RENEWABLE NATURAL GAS CONTRACT NO. OP59812000

1.	Contract Number: OP59812000	
2.	Recommended Vendor(s): Clean Energy Renewable Fuels LLC, Shell Energy North America (US) LP, and Trillium	
3.	Type of Procurement (check one): <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order	
4.	Procurement Dates:	
	A. Issued: 7/24/2019	
	B. Advertised/Publicized: 7/26/19, 7/27/19, 8/1/19, 8/5/19	
	C. Pre-proposal/Pre-Bid Conference: 8/7/19	
	D. Proposals/Bids Due: 10/24/19	
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: 9/14/20	
	F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics: 12/6/19	
	G. Protest Period End Date: (15 Calendar Days after Notification of Intent to Award) 10/1/20	
5.	Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded: 44	Bids/Proposals Received: 7
6.	Contract Administrator: Lorretta Norris	Telephone Number: (213) 922-2632
7.	Project Manager: Craig Reiter	Telephone Number: (213) 418-3476

A. Procurement Background

This Board Action is to approve three (3) Indefinite Delivery/Indefinite Quantity (IDIQ) Contracts for the procurement of Renewable Natural Gas (RNG) in support of Metro's bus fleet for Divisions 8, 9, 10, 13, 15 and 18. Board approval of contract awards is subject to resolution of any properly submitted protest(s).

A Request for Proposal (RFP) No. OP59812 was issued on July 24, 2019, in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is an Indefinite Delivery, Indefinite Quantity (IDIQ).

Five (5) Amendments were issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued August 2, 2019; provided pre-proposal conference call-in number;
- Amendment No. 2, issued September 06, 2019; revised proposal due date;

- Amendment No. 3, issued October 10, 2019; revised RFP Submittal Requirements;
- Amendment No. 4, issued October 14, 2019; revised RFP Supplemental Instructions to Proposers; and,
- Amendment No. 5, issued November 25, 2019; revised RFP Evaluation Criteria

A Pre-Proposal Conference was held August 7, 2019 and attended by nine (9) potential proposers.

A total of fifty (50) questions were received and responded to prior to the proposal due date.

A total of seven (7) proposals were received, October 24, 2019.

B. Evaluation of Proposals

This procurement was conducted in accordance with and complies with Metro’s Acquisition Policy for a Technically Acceptable Lowest Price (TALP) competitive RFP.

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro Environmental Compliance and Sustainability, Construction Management, Office of Management and Budget, and Treasury convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received. The seven (7) proposals were evaluated for technical competence using the pre-established evaluation criteria listed in the RFP. Four (4) proposals were deemed Not Technically Acceptable.

Proposers are listed in alphabetical order with rating received from Metro’s Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) based the RFP defined evaluation criteria:

Proposers	Rating
ampRenew Offtake I LLC	Technically Not Acceptable
Archaea Holdings, LLC	Technically Not Acceptable
Clean Energy Renewable Fuels LLC	Technically Acceptable
Shell Energy North America (US) LP	Technically Acceptable
Trillium	Technically Acceptable
Trustar Energy LLC	Technically Not Acceptable
U.S. Gain a division of U.S. Venture, Inc.	Technically Not Acceptable

In accordance with the solicitation, Metro is making multiple awards to three (3) qualified RNG suppliers. The multiple RNG suppliers will provide the best solutions relative to greenhouse gas emissions, managed energy costs, and optimization of environmental commodities.

Three (3) of the above proposers were deemed fully Responsive to all Metro's RFP requirements and are found to be Responsible proposers. Four (4) of the above proposers were deemed Non-Responsive to the RFP after being found Technically Not Acceptable. That determination was based on their inability to provide RNG output(s) to meet Metro's division(s) volume delivery requirements, and not meeting other statement of work requirements.

C. Price Analysis

A price analysis was conducted comparing the lowest price per therm rates for each Division, per proposer.

Based on adequate price competition, price analysis and technical analyses performed, and the comparability to Metro's Independent Cost Estimate (ICE) of \$68,126,875 – the proposed per therm price rates for Clean Energy, Trillium and Shell, incorporating defined Low Carbon Fuel Standard (LCFS) and Renewable Identification Number (RIN) credit yields – the total proposed price rates have been determined to be fair and reasonable.

D. Background on Recommended Contractor

CLEAN ENERGY

The recommended firm, CLEAN ENERGY FUELS LLC, has over eleven (11) years of experience in the natural gas industry, including production, marketing, sales, and distribution. Clean Energy is the only company that built, owns and operates natural gas production facilities and is a registered Energy Service Provider with SoCalGas. Since 2009, Clean Energy has delivered natural gas to customers at customer owned stations as well as Clean Energy owned public access stations. Some of Clean Energy's customers include Foothill Transit, City of Santa Monica (Big Blue Bus), Sacramento Municipal Utilities District, City of Sacramento, and University of California, San Diego, and Atlas Refuel. Clean Energy has been a Metro supplier of natural gas products, CNG, RNG, and commodities for over 20 years and their services to Metro have been satisfactory. Clean Energy is Metro's current RNG supplier.

SHELL ENERGY NORTH AMERICA

The recommended firm, SHELL ENERGY NORTH AMERICA (US) LP (headquartered in the Netherlands), is an international energy company with expertise in the exploration, production, refining and marketing of oil and natural gas, and the manufacturing and marketing of chemicals. Royal Dutch Shell plc, the parent company, was formed in 1907, but its history can be traced back to the first

half of the 19th century. Shell operates in over 70 countries and its strategy is to strengthen its position as a leading energy company by providing oil and gas and low-carbon energy as the world's energy system changes.

TRILLIUM

The recommended firm, TRILLIUM, acquired in 2016 by Love's Travel Stops & Country Stores (headquartered in Oklahoma City), has over two (2) decades of refueling experience and owns 65 public-access CNG facilities. Trillium is a leading developer of alternative fueling system design and provides installation and operations for innovative energy solutions. Trillium's fuels include Compressed Natural Gas (CNG), Renewable Natural Gas (RNG), Hydrogen, and Electric Vehicle (EV) Charging infrastructure. Trillium specializes in designing, building, and operating these facilities, and provides 24/7 maintenance services for various types of professional fleets.