

PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

TRASH AND VEGETATION REMOVAL SERVICES / OP911660008370 and
OP911660018370

1.	Contract Number: A. OP911660008370 (Region 1) B. OP911660018370 (Regions 2 & 3)	
2.	Recommended Vendor: A. Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc. (Region 1) B. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc. (Region 2 & 3)	
3.	Type of Procurement (check one): <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order	
4.	Procurement Dates:	
	A. Issued: August 18, 2022	
	B. Advertised/Publicized: August 18, 2022	
	C. Pre-Proposal Conference: August 25, 2022	
	D. Proposals Due: October 7, 2022	
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: March 29, 2023	
	F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics: February 1, 2023	
	G. Protest Period End Date: June 20, 2023	
5.	Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded: 19	Bids/Proposals Received: Region 1: 3 proposals Region 2: 2 proposals Region 3: 2 proposals
6.	Contract Administrator: Marc Margoni	Telephone Number: 213-922-1304
7.	Project Manager: Rommel Hilario	Telephone Number: 213-922-6733

A. Procurement Background

This Board action is to approve the award of Contract No. OP911660008370 (Region 1) to Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc. and Contract No. OP911660018370 (Regions 2 & 3) to Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc., to provide trash removal, bulky item pick-up and overgrown vegetation removal services throughout Metro rail and bus facilities, active and inactive Right-of-Ways (ROW), Metro Park & Ride (P&R) Lots, and Caltrans P&R Lots. The service is split into three geographical regions: Regions 1, 2, and 3. Board approval of contract awards is subject to the resolution of any properly submitted protest(s).

Prior to the release of the solicitation, Metro conducted five virtual Systemwide Metro Connect Industry Forum Outreach events: October 20, October 27, and November 3, 2021, and July 13 and 27, 2022. During the outreach events, staff provided an overview detailing the new enhanced MSZ and SBE Program policy for competitively negotiated procurements. These events also informed the small business community of the upcoming contracting opportunity and to increase and promote small business participation.

On August 18, 2022, Request for Proposal (RFP) No. OP91166 was issued as a competitive procurement in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is firm-fixed unit rate.

Region 1 was issued under Metro's Small Business Prime Set-Aside Program and was open only to Metro-Certified Small Business Enterprise (SBE) firms. An SBE submitting a proposal must perform a commercially useful function (CUF) or at least 30% of the total cost of the contract to be eligible for contract award.

Regions 2 and 3 were issued under Metro's Medium-Size Business Enterprise II (MSZ-II) Program. Under the MSZ-II Program, other-sized firms may submit proposals, however, if more than one responsive and responsible MSZ proposal is received, Metro may make an award to an MSZ. Metro will only consider proposals from other-sized firms if only one MSZ-II proposal is received, or no MSZ-II proposals are received. Further, proposers were required to meet the 22% SBE goal and a 3% Disabled Veteran Business Enterprise (DVBE) goal.

Trash and vegetation removal are among the services that are part of Metro's agency-wide strategy to provide partnering opportunities to Community-Based Organizations (CBOs). RFP No. OP91166 encouraged potential proposers to work with CBOs that have direct experience, relationships, and expertise in the geographical locations where trash and vegetation removal services shall be performed.

Four amendments were issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on August 24, 2022, extended the proposal due date to September 19, 2022;
- Amendment No. 2, issued on September 9, 2022, extended the proposal due date to September 26, 2022;
- Amendment No. 3, issued on September 22, 2022, deleted the requirement for Contractor's Pollution Liability Insurance; and
- Amendment No. 4, issued on September 27, 2022, extended the proposal due date to October 7, 2022.

A virtual pre-proposal conference was held on August 25, 2022, and was attended by two participants, representing two firms. There were four questions received, and responses were provided prior to the proposal due date.

A total of 19 firms downloaded the RFP and were included on the planholders' list.

On October 7, 2022, Metro received the following proposals which are listed below in alphabetical order:

Region 1

1. Bread & Water Landscaping, LLC.
2. Far East Landscape and Maintenance, Inc.
3. Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.

Region 2

1. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.
2. Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.

Region 3

1. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.
2. Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.

B. Evaluation of Proposals

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro's Facilities Contracted Maintenance Services, Facilities/Properties Maintenance and Service Planning Departments was convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received for all three regions.

On October 26, 2022, the PET met to review the evaluation criteria package, process confidentiality and conflict of interest forms and take receipt of the proposals to initiate the evaluation phase. Evaluations were conducted from October 26, 2022, through February 2, 2023.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria.

Phase I Evaluation – Minimum Qualification Review: This is a pass/fail criteria. To be responsive to the RFP minimum qualification requirements, proposers must meet the following:

- a) Must have at least three years of experience performing trash and vegetation removal services;
- b) Must have a valid and active Los Angeles County Haulers' permit
- c) Must own or lease one dump truck with 2 ½ ton capacity and one Ford 445 tractor, or equivalent, with mechanized mower and skip loader attachments; and
- d) Proposed Project Manager/Supervisor must have received safety training within the past three years.

For Region 1, the PET deemed two proposers non-responsive to the minimum qualification requirements for failure to provide a current and valid Los Angeles County Waste Hauler's permit at the time of proposal submittal. Hence, both firms were excluded from further consideration.

For Regions 2 and 3, Metro's Prequalification Office determined that both proposers did not meet the definition of an MSZ-II firm. However, since Metro did not receive proposals from any MSZ-II firms, the PET proceeded with the evaluation of all proposals received. Metro's Medium-Size Business Enterprise Program Policy provides that if Metro does not receive proposals from more than one responsive MSZ-II firm, it will consider offers from non-MSZ firms.

In view of the above, the PET proceeded with Phase II – Technical Evaluation of proposals received from the following firms:

Region 1

1. Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.

Regions 2 and 3

1. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.
2. Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.

Proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and weights:

- Qualification of the Firm/Team 15%
- Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel 20%
- Work Plan/Approach 35%
- Price Proposal 30%

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for similar procurements. Several factors were considered in developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to the proposer’s Work Plan and Approach.

At the conclusion of the evaluation process, the PET determined Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc. to be technically qualified to perform trash and vegetation removal services for Region 1. For Regions 2 and 3, the PET determined Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc. to be the top-ranked firm.

Qualifications Summary of Firms:

Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.

Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc., headquartered in Azusa, CA, has been in business for 33 years. It currently provides graffiti removal, anti-graffiti coating, steam cleaning, pressure washing and trash collection services to Metrolink, City of San Fernando, City of Burbank, City of West Hollywood, City of Covina, Compton, Arcadia, and various municipalities in Orange and Riverside Counties.

Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.

Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc, headquartered in Van Nuys, CA, has been servicing the Los Angeles, Ventura and Orange County areas for over 55 years and has relevant public transit system experience. Its current clients include the City of Long Beach Blue Line, the City of Irvine, the County of Los Angeles, the City of South Gate, and the City of Ventura.

Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.

Woods Maintenance Services, Inc. (Woods), located in North Hollywood, CA, has been in business for over 35 years. It provides graffiti removal, weed abatement, pressure washing, right-of-way clearance, landscape and irrigation maintenance services, and homeless encampment cleanup. Woods' clients include Metrolink, Orange County Transportation Authority, the California Department of Transportation, and the Los Angeles County Department of Public Works. Woods has been providing trash and vegetation removal services to Metro since 2001 and has performed satisfactorily.

The following is a summary of the PET scores.

Region 1

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	60.67	15%	9.10	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	68.90	20%	13.78	
5	Work/Plan Approach	80.66	35%	28.23	
6	Price Proposal	100.00	30%	30.00	
7	Total		100.00%	81.11	1

Region 2

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	97.33	15%	14.60	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	97.75	20%	19.55	
5	Work Plan/Approach	94.00	35%	32.90	
6	Price Proposal	100.00	30%	30.00	
7	Total		100.00%	97.05	1
8	Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.				
9	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	88.00	15%	13.20	

10	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	88.90	20%	17.78	
11	Work Plan/Approach	87.34	35%	30.57	
12	Price Proposal	90.60	30%	27.18	
13	Total		100.00%	88.73	2

Region 3

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.				
3	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	97.33	15%	14.60	
4	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	97.75	20%	19.55	
5	Work Plan/Approach	94.00	35%	32.90	
6	Price Proposal	100.00	30%	30.00	
7	Total		100.00%	97.05	1
8	Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.				
9	Qualifications of the Firm/Team	88.00	15%	13.20	
10	Qualifications and Experience of Key Personnel	88.90	20%	17.78	
11	Work Plan/Approach	87.34	35%	30.57	
12	Price Proposal	91.40	30%	27.42	
13	Total		100.00%	88.97	2

C. Price Analysis

Region 1

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on price analysis, technical analysis, and fact-finding. Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.'s price is approximately 9.43% lower than Metro's independent cost estimate (ICE).

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE	Recommended Amount
1	Urban Graffiti Enterprises	\$4,209,784	\$4,648,268	\$4,209,784

Region 2

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, technical analysis, and fact-finding. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.'s negotiated price is 11.93% lower than Metro's ICE.

Staff successfully negotiated a cost savings of \$58,881.

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE	Negotiated Amount
1	Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.	\$29,678,106	\$33,630,280	\$29,619,225
2	Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.	\$32,761,838		

Region 3

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on adequate price competition, price analysis, technical analysis, and fact-finding. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.'s negotiated price is 11.86% lower than Metro's ICE.

Staff successfully negotiated a cost savings of \$49,450.

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE	Negotiated Amount
1	Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.	\$24,901,048	\$28,196,736	\$24,851,598
2	Woods Maintenance Services, Inc.	\$27,242,800		

D. Background on Recommended Contractors

Region 1

Urban Graffiti Enterprises, Inc.

Urban Graffiti Enterprises (Urban Graffiti), headquartered in Azusa, California, has been providing graffiti removal, anti-graffiti coating, steam cleaning, pressure washing, and trash collection services since 1990. Urban Graffiti is a Metro-certified small business firm.

Urban Graffiti's proposed Project Manager has nearly 20 years of operational experience.

Regions 2 and 3

Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc.

Parkwood Landscape Maintenance, Inc. (Parkwood), headquartered in Van Nuys, California, has satellite offices in Bellflower, Long Beach, El Segundo, Alhambra, Lancaster, and Garden Grove. Founded in 1967, Parkwood has been providing professional landscape management services for municipalities, public works, and commercial projects for over 55 years. Parkwood has been providing trash and vegetation removal services to Metro since 2015 and performance has been satisfactory.

The Parkwood team includes one SBE firm, Far East Landscape, Inc. and one DVBE firm, IECLT, Inc. Both subcontractors have experience providing trash and vegetation removal services to Metro and performance has been satisfactory.

Parkwood's Project Manager has over 26 years of experience overseeing trash and vegetation removal services contracts. He is the project manager of Parkwood's current trash and vegetation removal services contract with Metro.