

## PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

**TECHNICAL CONSULTANT FOR ZERO EMISSION BUS PROGRAM  
MASTER PLAN/PS51220**

1.	<b>Contract Number:</b> PS51220	
2.	<b>Recommended Vendor:</b> ZEBGO Partners, Joint Venture	
3.	<b>Type of Procurement (check one):</b> <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order	
4.	<b>Procurement Dates:</b>	
	<b>A. Issued:</b> 02/14/18	
	<b>B. Advertised/Publicized:</b> 02/20/18; 02/21/18; 02/26/18	
	<b>C. Pre-Proposal Conference:</b> 02/27/18	
	<b>D. Proposals Due:</b> 03/29/18	
	<b>E. Pre-Qualification Completed:</b> 05/17/18	
	<b>F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics:</b> 05/31/18	
	<b>G. Protest Period End Date:</b> 07/20/18	
5.	<b>Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded:</b> 61	<b>Bids/Proposals Received:</b> 2
6.	<b>Contract Administrator:</b> Elizabeth Hernandez	<b>Telephone Number:</b> (213) 922-7334
7.	<b>Project Manager:</b> Marc Manning	<b>Telephone Number:</b> (213) 617-6201

**A. Procurement Background**

This Board Action is to approve Contract No. PS51220 for technical consulting support services to develop comprehensive plans for phasing in zero emission buses (ZEB) on Metro's entire system, including Local and Rapid bus routes, by 2030. Board approval of contract awards are subject to resolution of any properly submitted protest.

The RFP was issued in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is a cost plus fixed fee.

Five amendments were issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on March 12, 2018, clarified proposal requirements;
- Amendment No. 2, issued on March 23, 2018, clarified proposal requirements;
- Amendment No. 3, issued on May 7, 2018, clarified proposal requirements;
- Amendment No. 4, issued on May 11, 2018, solicited Best and Final Offers (BAFO); and
- Amendment No. 5, issued on May 15, 2018, clarified BAFO submittals.

A Pre-Proposal Conference was held on February 27, 2018. Proposer Questions and Metro staff answers were issued and made accessible to the planholders by posting them at Metro's website. A total of two proposals were received on March 29, 2018.

## **B. Evaluation of Proposals**

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Vehicle Engineering and Acquisition, Maintenance and Operations departments was convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and weights:

- Experience and Capability 30 percent
- Project Understanding/Approach and Management Plan 20 percent
- Firm's Experience on Similar Projects 15 percent
- Availability 5 percent
- Price 30 percent

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for other, similar professional services procurement. Several factors were considered when developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to experience and capability in performing similar work.

Both of the proposals received were determined to be within the competitive range. The two firms within the competitive range are listed below in alphabetical order:

1. Ramboll US Corporation
2. ZEBGO Partners, Joint Venture

The proposal evaluation period from March 29, 2018 through May 29, 2018 included reviews of the written proposals, clarifications requests and responses, oral presentations, face-to-face and conference call discussions, and transit agency reference checks. On April 26, 2018 the PET met and interviewed the firms. The firms' project manager, deputy project manager, and lead subject matter experts (SMEs) had an opportunity to present individual and team's qualifications and respond to the PET's questions. In general, each team's presentation addressed the requirements of the RFP, experience with all aspects of the required tasks, and stressed each firm's commitment to the success of the project. Also highlighted were staffing plans, work plans, perceived program challenges and risk mitigation process. Each team was asked questions relative to each firm's proposed methodology/approach and previous experience for a program with similar scope and size.

A cost analysis was performed on the Proposer's price offers in preparation of negotiations conducted on May 3, 2018. Proposer strengths and weaknesses in technical and price elements were discussed prior to requesting Best and Final offers. Best and Final Offers (BAFO) were solicited on May 11, 2018 and submittals

were received on May 22, 2018. The BAFOS were reviewed and evaluated by the PET from May 23, 2018 through May 29, 2018.

## **Qualifications Summary of Firms within the Competitive Range:**

### **ZEBGO Partners, JV**

#### **WSP (Partner)**

WSP is an engineering and professional consulting firm founded in 1885 and has 42,000 employees and 500 offices globally. It has 100 offices in the United States and four of them are located in Southern California with a staff of 300 employees.

WSP has electric bus experience with more than 30 projects in the world, including 13 in North America for transit agencies such as Massachusetts DOT, King County Metro, DART, and IndyGo. WSP has planned, designed and rehabilitated more than 700 bus maintenance facilities.

#### **STV (Partner)**

STV, Incorporated was founded over 100 years ago and provides architectural, engineering, planning, environmental, and construction management services for transportation systems, infrastructure, buildings, energy, and other facilities.

STV has over 30 years of experience planning, designing and implementing bus projects for public transit agencies such as LADOT, SANDAG, OCTA and SEPTA.

The ZEBGO JV proposes to augment its capabilities with expertise and specialty resources in areas such as utility coordination and interface, technology facilitation, industry outreach and best practices, facilities inventory and conversion options, sustainability practices and metrics, project administration, document control, Buy America compliance, and bus procurement and inspection. The ZEBGO team includes the following subcontractors:

- Advantec Consulting Engineers, Inc.
- Advanced Mobility Group
- Capitol GCS
- Center for Transportation and Environment (CTE)
- Fuel Solutions
- 3Cotech
- Virginkar & Associates

ZEBGO has multiple subject matter experts (SME) with transit agency experience in operating, maintaining, and procuring buses. ZEBGO would be able to leverage three different electric bus modeling techniques that had been developed and

utilized for other agencies. ZEBGO's proposal discussed experience for over 50 Zero Emission Bus (ZEB) projects. This includes an electric bus feasibility study with King County. With these projects, ZEBGO has relevant experience in deploying both depot and en-route charging infrastructure. ZEBGO's subcontractor, CTE, has worked with numerous transit agencies to model, procure, and deploy electric and fuel cell buses. Due to relevant experience, they have the ability to work on various tasks with minimal Metro oversight and accelerate various tasks as needed to meet procurement schedules.

### **Ramboll US Corporation**

Ramboll US Corporation, formed in 1982, provides technical and strategic consulting expertise to clients for environmental and health issues. Ramboll has more than 13,000 employees in 200 offices located in 35 countries. Ramboll's local management staff is located in Los Angeles.

Ramboll currently provides technical support to Metro through the Advanced Technology Transit Vehicle Consortium (ATVC) for its recent Zero Emission Bus procurements and with regulatory agencies on air pollution policy impacts to Metro's bus acquisition plans. Ramboll also has project experience with the municipality of Oslo and Akershus county of Norway in assessment of bus fleet electrification via in-motion-charging trolley buses. Ramboll's clients include the Port of Los Angeles, AC Transit, San Diego Metropolitan Transportation Systems (MTS), SANDAG, Santa Monica, Foothill, and Translink.

Ramboll proposed a team of subject matter experts in ZE technologies and systems integration, bus operations, service planning, facilities, utilities, and financing at the local level and from global and nationwide agencies consisting of the following:

- AECOM
- M.J. Bradley & Associates
- Gladstein, Neandross & Associates
- Capitol CGS
- Connetics Transportation Group
- Burns & McDonnell
- McCormick Busse, Inc.
- Virginkar & Associates

Ramboll's proposal identified some key personnel from local and global resources. Additionally, they have staff with zero emission vehicle experience at Metro. They also demonstrated experience in utility and capacity planning with Los Angeles Department of Water and Power (LADWP). Currently, their relevant electric bus experience is limited on deployment of charging infrastructure. They have a few projects in process that would provide that relevant experience in the future. The PET evaluated the proposals and assessed strengths, weaknesses and associated risks of each Proposal utilizing the evaluation criteria factors and sub-

factors defined in the RFP to determine the score for each firm. The ZEBGO JV had demonstrated advantages in all technical areas of Experience and Capability; Project Approach and Experience for relevant Projects of similar scope and size. Based upon the collective evaluations, ZEBGO Partners, JV is determined to be the PET's recommendation for the top ranked firm based on the scores as indicated in the table below.

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	<b>ZEBGO Partners, JV</b>				
3	Experience and Capability	86.40	30.00%	25.92	
4	Project Understanding/Approach and Management Plan	82.50	20.00%	16.50	
5	Firm's Experience on Similar Projects	82.53	15.00%	12.38	
6	Availability	85.00	5.00%	4.25	
7	Price	75.20	30.00%	22.56	
8	<b>Total</b>		100.00%	81.62	<b>1</b>
9	<b>Ramboll US Corporation</b>				
10	Experience and Capability	60.63	30.00%	18.19	
11	Project Understanding/Approach and Management Plan	61.75	20.00%	12.35	
12	Firm's Experience on Similar Projects	55.00	15.00%	8.25	
13	Availability	66.20	5.00%	3.31	
14	Price	100.00	30.00%	30.00	
15	<b>Total</b>		100.00%	72.10	<b>2</b>

### C. Cost/Price Analysis

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based upon adequate price competition, Management Audit Services (MAS) audit findings, an independent cost estimate, cost analysis, technical evaluation, fact finding, and negotiations.

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE*	Negotiated or NTE amount
1.	ZEBGO Partners, JV	\$7,690,905	<b>\$6,505,706</b>	<b>\$7,139,376</b>
2.	Ramboll US Corporation	\$5,483,671	\$6,505,706	\$5,370,780

\*ICE includes costs for labor, travel and fee; excludes direct costs and general and administrative costs

### Best Value Analysis

Metro's PET determined that when considering price and non-price factors, ZEBGO's proposal provides the Best Value and is most advantageous to Metro. Price analysis shows that the negotiated amount for the recommended firm, ZEBGO, is \$633,670 above the ICE. ZEBGO's higher priced proposal, from a Best Value perspective, offers clear advantages in the areas of relevant Zero Emission vehicle and infrastructure experience and capability, project understanding/ approach and management plan, and past experience for similar projects evaluation categories.

ZEBGO's higher proposed price is offset by providing a team of subject matter experts that far exceeded the minimum staff qualifications and collectively, have multiple transit agency experience in operating, maintaining and procuring buses, both from the manufacturing and transit operations sides. The ZEBGO JV team demonstrated a wide array of global electric bus experience, including deployment of electric bus depot and in-route chargers and experience with projects with other United States transit agencies that are similar in scope and scale as the LA Metro program. This relevant experience and expertise in ZEB vehicle and infrastructure is critically important to the technology transition because of Metro's program timeline objectives and the rapid changes occurring in this developing field. ZEBGO will utilize three types of service-proven simulation and modeling tools to validate various bus electrification scenarios.

#### **D. Background on Recommended Contractor**

The recommended firm, ZEBGO Partners, Joint Venture, is a partnership formed between WSP USA Inc. (formerly WSP|Parsons Brinckerhoff) and STV Incorporated to provide technical consulting services for Metro's Zero Emission Bus (ZEB) Program Master Plan. Both of the partners in the JV have offices located in Los Angeles, California.

Under a similar joint venture partnership, WSP and STV were awarded contracts to develop the performance-based technical specifications and commercial requirements for procurement of heavy rail vehicles for Metro and Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority (MBTA). As a joint venture, these firms have undertaken the following transportation projects for Los Angeles:

- Heavy Rail Vehicle Acquisition Consulting Services and Program Control Support Services (LACMTA)
- Los Angeles World Airport Landslide Access Modernization Program
- Connect LAX Airport Metro Connector

ZEBGO's team of subject matter experts has ZEB master planning experience with other large transit agencies that include Boston, Seattle, Indianapolis and Albuquerque in the U.S., and Halifax and Calgary in Canada.