

PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

**REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL SERVICES BENCH
PS66091000 through PS66091018**

1.	Contract Number: PS66091000 through PS66091018	
2.	Recommended Vendor: Various (see Attachment A-1)	
3.	Type of Procurement (check one): <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFIQ	
4.	Procurement Dates:	
	A. Issued: October 21, 2019	
	B. Advertised/Publicized: October 21, 2019	
	C. Pre-Proposal Conference: November 1, 2019	
	D. Proposals Due: January 16, 2020	
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: In-process	
	F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics: April 22, 2020	
	G. Protest Period End Date: August 25, 2020	
5.	Solicitations Picked-up/Downloaded: 56	Proposals Received: 27
6.	Contract Administrator: Mark Marukian	Telephone Number: 213-418-3313
7.	Project Manager: Michael Daniels	Telephone Number: 213-922-3584

A. Procurement Background

This Board Action is to approve Contract Nos. PS66091000 through PS66091018 issued to provide Real Estate Appraisal Bench services. Board approval of contract awards are subject to resolution of any properly submitted protest.

Contracts will be issued to the qualified contractors for professional services required in support of the following real estate acquisition discipline requirements: (1) Real Estate Appraisals, (2) Furniture, Fixtures & Equipment Appraisals and (3) Business Goodwill Appraisals.

The Request for Information and Qualifications (RFIQ) was issued on October 21, 2019 in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy. The RFIQ was issued with a Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) goal of 8%. Task orders will be issued on a competitive, firm fixed price basis.

Work will be authorized through the issuance of separate task orders. Individual task order requests under the Bench Contracts will be issued to all qualified Contractors within a specific discipline and will be competed and awarded based on the specific statement of work.

Two amendments were issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on November 13, 2019, updated DBE participation language and extended the proposal due date.

- Amendment No. 2, issued on December 3, 2019, updated Submittal Requirements and List of Current Projects forms.

A pre-proposal conference was held on November 1, 2019 and was attended by 23 participants representing 19 firms. A follow up meeting was held on November 20, 2019 to provide further clarification on DBE requirements and firm certifications. During the solicitation phase, 40 questions were asked, and responses were released prior to the proposal due date.

A total of 56 firms downloaded the RFP and were included in the planholders list. A total of 27 proposals were received on January 16, 2020.

B. Evaluation of Proposals

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of Metro's Real Estate Department staff was established. The PET convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and weights:

- | | |
|--|------------|
| • Appraisal Experience | 40 percent |
| • Review of Sample Reports | 30 percent |
| • Education/Experience and Professional Qualifications | 25 percent |
| • Expert Witness Experience | 5 percent |

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for other, similar real estate appraisal services bench procurements. Several factors were considered when developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to appraisal experience.

The technical evaluation of the 27 proposals received concluded in June 2020. Of the 27 proposals, eight were considered non-responsive as a result of not providing required DEOD forms, not meeting the established DBE goal, and/or not meeting DBE good faith efforts.

All remaining 19 responsive proposals are within the competitive range and are being recommended for the bench contracts. After internal reviews and discussion, the PET determined interviews were not necessary. There are 17 firms that represent the 19 proposals.

The 17 responsive firms within the competitive range are listed below in alphabetical order:

1. BTI Appraisal
2. CBRE, Inc.

3. Cushman & Wakefield Western, Inc.
4. Desmond, Marcello & Amster, LLC
5. Donna Desmond Associates
6. Elizabeth M. Kiley dba Integra Realty Resources – Orange County
7. Epic Land Solutions, Inc.
8. Hennessey & Hennessey LLC
9. Integra Realty Resources – Los Angeles
10. Keith Settle and Company, Inc.
11. Lea Associates, Inc.
12. Norris Realty Advisors
13. Pacific Real Estate Consultants, Inc.
14. R.P. Laurain & Associates, Inc.
15. Riggs & Riggs, Inc.
16. Santolucito Doré Group, Inc.
17. Thompson & Thompson Real Estate Valuation and Consulting

Qualifications Summary of Recommended Firms

BTI Appraisal

Established in 1974, BTI Appraisal is headquartered in the heart of Downtown Los Angeles with an office in Orange County. BTI Appraisal is involved in covering the disciplines of real estate, machinery and equipment, business, and goodwill valuation services.

In their proposal, BTI described their experience representing a wide range of governmental entities in the United States and abroad for eminent domain partial and full takes, review appraisals, redevelopment, insurance coverage, lending purposes, bond insurance, relocations, fair market lease rates analysis, bill boards, subsurface and air rights, natural disaster losses, and historical dates of value.

CBRE, Inc.

Since 2008, CBRE is publicly traded and has been a Fortune 500 company. As one of the largest appraisal firms in the world, CBRE has over 90 valuation offices across the United States and has been involved in numerous property appraisals in the United States affected by public projects including transportation, heavy rail, light rail, and high-speed rail projects.

In their proposal, CBRE and its appraisers have worked with numerous public agencies and thoroughly understands local, state, and federal requirements associated with right of way appraisal assignments.

Cushman & Wakefield Western, Inc.

Cushman & Wakefield Western Inc. headquartered in Los Angeles, California, is a wholly owned subsidiary and has performed appraisal services in California

providing real estate valuation and advisory services for numerous California public agencies.

In their proposal, Cushman & Wakefield described their experience with providing real estate valuation and consulting services related to condemnation actions and eminent domain proceedings for various types of properties within California.

Desmond, Marcello & Amster LLC

Founded in 1968, Desmond, Marcello & Amster LLC (DM&A) has provided clients in both the public and private sectors with expertise in the valuation of closely-held businesses, professional practices, and specific intangible assets, such as business goodwill and tangible assets, such as furniture, fixtures and equipment (FF&E).

In their proposal, DM&A has demonstrated that they possess over 50 years of experience appraising businesses, completing thousands of goodwill loss appraisals and has prepared FF&E appraisals for acquisition and eminent domain purposes for over 30 years for both government agencies and private parties.

Donna Desmond Associates

Founded in 1997, Donna Desmond Associates is a business valuation firm specializing in valuing goodwill loss in eminent domain proceedings and since that time, has worked closely with agencies and their consultants to provide goodwill appraisals.

In their proposal, Donna Desmond Associates has been involved in goodwill appraisals throughout California and has provided Metro with multiple goodwill appraisals with various projects for Metro right of way, along with other California transportation agencies such as Orange County Transportation Agency, Riverside County Transportation Commission, and San Bernardino County Transportation Authority.

Elizabeth M. Kiley d.b.a Integra Realty Resources – Orange County

Elizabeth M. Kiley, Inc. was founded on February 17, 2002 and operated with the dba Kiley Company until August 1, 2019 when it was purchased by Beth B. Finestone. Elizabeth M. Kiley, Inc. now operates under the dba Integra Realty Resources – Orange County (IRR-OC). IRR-OC has been involved in appraising properties subject to eminent domain under both State and Federal rules.

In their proposal, IRR-OC described their experience in valuing properties subject to full and partial acquisitions with the requirements of public agencies and right of way firms. They demonstrated appraising of most types of real property including but not limited to, office buildings, shopping centers, industrial properties, hotels and motels, multifamily residential properties, single-family residences, schools and business.

Epic Land Solutions, Inc.

Founded in 2002, Epic Land Solutions, Inc. is a full-service real property appraisal and right of way services firm appraising a wide range of properties throughout the west coast focusing on acquisition and eminent domain work.

Epic Land Solutions, Inc. has served a wide range of public agency clients, including municipalities, counties, water districts, school districts, public utilities, airports, housing authorities, and transportation agencies.

Hennessey & Hennessey LLC

Since 1979, the primary emphasis of Hennessey & Hennessey LLC has been appraisal for eminent domain purposes for public agencies, specializing in appraising properties for negotiated acquisitions, surplus property dispositions, and litigation, as well as appraisal reviews and related services.

In their proposal, Hennessey & Hennessey LLC demonstrated an understanding of the process and complexity involved in eminent domain law. Hennessey & Hennessey LLC have valued permanent easements for various purposes, as well as temporary construction easements, and compensation for loss of use. Hennessey & Hennessey LLC has worked on numerous projects for eminent domain purposes with transportation authorities including Orange County Transportation Agency, Riverside County Transportation Commission, San Bernardino County Transportation Authority, California High-Speed Rail Authority, various cities, and other agencies.

Integra Realty Resources – Los Angeles

Integra Realty Resources – Los Angeles (IRR-LA) is an independently owned firm since 1999. IRR-LA has been in business providing real estate and consulting services for over 20 years. IRR-LA conducts real estate valuation and counseling services for a broad range of property types, addressing diverse client needs.

In their proposal, IRR-LA described their experience with governmental agencies, lending institutions, investment advisory firms, corporations, developers, investors, and the legal profession. The IRR-LA team has significant experience in valuing full and partial acquisitions associated with right of way projects conducting appraisals of investment-grade properties, including office buildings, shopping centers, industrial developments, hotels and motels, apartment and condominium complexes, mobile home parks, and industrial and residential subdivision acreage.

Keith Settle and Company, Inc.

Founded in 1987 and incorporated in 2009, Keith Settle and Company Inc. is a real estate appraisal firm with its principal line of business being real estate/appraisal services with one office located in Sherman Oaks, California.

In their proposal, Keith Settle and Company Inc. demonstrated over 30 years of real estate appraisal services experience appraising a wide variety of property, including commercial, industrial, and residential real estate throughout the Southern California region. Keith Settle and Company Inc. has appraised property for full takings, partial takings, and easements, for government entities. Keith Settle and Company Inc. also has experience testifying in court in support of litigation.

Lea Associates, Inc.

Since 1976, Lea Associates, Inc. has been in continuous operation as a full-service real estate consulting firm which provides real property appraisal services. Lea Associates, Inc. operates through one office in the Westwood area of Los Angeles.

In their proposal, Lea Associates, Inc. demonstrated over 50 years of extensive experience in the appraisal of all types of real property involved in eminent domain settings, on an acquisition level and under condemnation proceedings. Lea Associates, Inc. has provided multiple services with government agencies, including Los Angeles Department of Water and Power, United States General Service Administration, Metropolitan Water District of Southern California, and has worked on Metro Purple Line and Crenshaw/LAX Transit Corridor Projects.

Norris Realty Advisors

Founded in 2000, Norris Realty Advisors, a commercial real estate valuation and consulting firm, has provided both valuation and advisory services to a wide variety of clients, including consulting for mortgage financing purposes, pension fund advisors, insurance companies, governmental agencies, high net worth trust and estate valuation, as well as expert witness and taxation issues.

In their proposal, Norris Realty Advisors, described that they have been involved in several highly complex and unusual valuation assignments, with a specialization in forensic valuation, litigation support, right-of-way, and infrastructure consulting. Norris Realty Advisors has worked with the City of Anaheim, Los Angeles Department of Water and Power, City of Los Angeles, and Metro.

Pacific Real Estate Consultants, Inc.

Since 1987, Pacific Real Estate Consultants, Inc. is a small business that provides real estate appraisal and consulting services to government agencies, cities, lenders, insurance companies, attorneys, accountants, developer's, and individuals.

In their proposal, Pacific Real Estate Consultants, Inc. described having governmental and private agency project experience and background to perform a wide variety of real estate appraisal and consulting services. Pacific Real Estate Consultants, Inc. specializes in all types of real property with an emphasis on income properties, land, partial interest valuations, and the appraisal of special purpose types of property. They have worked on multiple projects with the City of Los Angeles, City of Tustin, and Metro.

R.P. Laurain & Associates, Inc.

R.P. Laurain & Associates, Inc. was established in January 1969, for the purpose of providing professional real estate appraisal services. R. P. Laurain & Associates, Inc. was incorporated November 5, 1979. This appraisal firm has been involved in a variety of real estate appraisal and consultation assignments including many right-of-way projects of full and partial acquisition studies, special use private and public properties, as well as studies for specialized acquisitions of aerial easements, aviation easements, and subway tunnel easements.

In their proposal, R.P. Laurain & Associates, Inc. demonstrated having over 45 years of expertise conducting acquisition and eminent domain appraisal studies. R.P. Laurain & Associates, Inc. has provided services for local, state and federal governmental agencies, of which real estate appraisal services have been conducted for Metro for over 25 years.

Riggs & Riggs, Inc.

Riggs & Riggs, Inc. is a California corporation established in 1995 that provides appraisal and consulting services and has an extensive background in preparing appraisal and consulting assignments for right of way projects both for negotiation and condemnation purposes.

In their proposal, Riggs & Riggs, Inc. demonstrated having over 19 years of right of way appraisal experience. In addition, Riggs & Riggs, Inc. has conducted numerous projects in analyzing and preparing complex right of way assignments, including estimating the value of partial acquisitions of fee, permanent easements, and temporary construction easement interests, as well as estimate severance damages and benefits for public projects.

Santolucito Doré Group, Inc.

Santolucitio Doré Group, Inc., formed in 2015, specializes in real estate appraisal services for public agencies. Santolucitio Doré Group, Inc. is in California and has background in performing appraisals and appraisal reviews for acquisition, right of way, and eminent domain purposes.

In their proposal, Santolucito Doré Group, Inc. described having experience working on multiple public projects throughout California and providing appraisal services, such as cost estimating for budgetary purposes and alternative design analysis, full and partial acquisition appraisals, appraisal reviews, litigation support, and expert testimony.

Thompson & Thompson Real Estate Valuation and Consulting

Incorporated in January 2020, Thompson & Thompson Real Estate Valuation and Consulting is a California corporation that specializes in eminent domain appraisal and litigation support and provides services within California and Arizona. Thompson & Thompson Real Estate Valuation and Consulting has experience providing appraisal services for public and private agencies, including transportation agencies.

In their proposal, Thompson & Thompson Real Estate Valuation and Consulting demonstrated their experience conducting litigation and complex valuations (appraisal and appraisal review) specializing in eminent domain for direct condemnation and inverse condemnation. They described working on multiple projects various agencies including California Department of Transportation, Riverside County Transportation Commission, Orange County Transportation Authority, and Metro.

C. Cost/Price Analysis

The RFIQ contained neither price nor a specific statement of work (SOW). Each future RFP task order will contain a detailed discipline specific SOW which will be competed with the firms within the applicable discipline. Bench contractors will propose a price according to the requirements in the task order SOW and pricing will be determined fair and reasonable based on an independent cost estimate (ICE), a cost/price analysis, fact finding, and negotiations as applicable.

D. Background on Recommended Contractor

All 17 firms listed above, under Qualifications Summary, are recommended for award. These firms have been evaluated and are determined to be responsive and responsible to perform work on Metro assignments on an as-needed, task order basis.