ATTACHMENT A

PROCUREMENT SUMMARY
RENEWABLE NATURAL GAS (RNG) PROVIDER/OP132076000

1.	**Contract Number**: OP132076000	
2.	**Recommended Vendor**: Shell Energy North America (US), L.P.	
3.	**Type of Procurement (check one):** ☐ **IFB** ☒ **RFP** ☐ **RFP–A&E** ☐ **Non-Competitive** ☐ **Modification** ☐ **Task Order**	
4.	**Procurement Dates**:	
	A. **Issued**: 07/02/2025	
	B. **Advertised/Publicized**: 07/03/2025	
	C. **Pre-Proposal Conference**: 07/09/2025	
	D. **Proposals Due**: 08/11/2025	
	E. **Pre-Qualification Completed**: 09/04/2025	
	F. **Ethics Declarations Form Submitted to Ethics**: 08/11/2025	
	G. **Protest Period End Date**: 04/21/2026	
5.	**Solicitations Downloaded**: 33	**Bids/Proposals Received**: 5
6.	**Contract Administrator:** Ricardo E. Narvaez	**Telephone Number:** (213) 418-3158
7.	**Project Manager**: Uduak-Joe Ntuk	**Telephone Number**: (213) 922-4197

A. Procurement Background

This Board Action is to approve Contract No. OP132076000 for the procurement of Renewable Natural Gas (RNG) to fulfill Metro's RNG bus fuel requirements. Board approval of contract awards is subject to the resolution of any properly submitted protest(s), if any.

Request for Proposal (RFP) No. OP132076 was issued in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is an Indefinite Delivery/Indefinite Quantity (IDIQ). The Diversity & Economic Opportunity Department (DEOD) did not recommend a goal for this solicitation.

Four (4) amendments were issued for this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued July 25, 2025, revised the schedule of quantities and prices, and added the certification of prospective contractor form exhibit to the RFP.
- Amendment No. 2, issued July 30, 2025, extended the proposal and prequalification due date.
- Amendment No. 3, issued August 8, 2025, revised the evaluation criteria.
- Amendment No. 4, issued November 24, 2025, revised the evaluation criteria.

A total of 104 firms downloaded the RFP and were included on the planholders' list. A virtual pre-proposal conference was held on July 9, 2025, and was attended by 10 participants. There were 31 questions received for this RFP and responses were provided prior to the proposal due date.

A total of five proposals were received by the due date of August 11, 2025, and are listed below in alphabetical order:

1. Anew RNG, LLC (Anew)
2. Clean Energy Renewable Fuels, LLC dba in CA as Clean Energy Renewables (Clean Energy)
3. Shell Energy North America (US), LP (Shell)
4. Trillium USA Company, LLC (Trillium)
5. U.S. Venture, Inc. (U.S. Energy)

B. Evaluation of Proposals

A diverse Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro's Office of Sustainability, Program Management, and Strategic Financial Management departments was convened to conduct a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received.

The proposals were evaluated according to the following evaluation criteria:

• Qualifications, capabilities and experience	30 percent
• Proposed project organization & staffing	15 percent
• Project approach & work plan	15 percent
• Price Proposal	40 percent

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for other similar procurements. Several factors were considered when developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to the price and qualifications, capabilities, and experience.

On August 21, 2025, the evaluation committee conducted virtual interviews with the firms. The firm's key personnel had an opportunity to present each team's qualifications and respond to the evaluation committee's questions. In general, each team's presentation addressed each firm's technical proposal with a focus on the industry experience, organizational resources, and work plan to deliver the requirements.

Each firm was asked questions regarding their strategy for ensuring supply continuity, systems in place for transparent tracking of RNG volumes, commitment to supply Metro's full requirement and volume availability, existing RNG production sites relative to the pipeline interconnection serving Metro CNG stations, process to ensure regulatory compliance, and experience mitigating challenges with RNG credits to past clients.

All five (5) firms were determined to be in the competitive range.

Qualifications Summary of Firms within the Competitive Range:

Anew RNG, LLC (Anew)

Anew is headquartered in Houston, Texas and has a global presence in other US and European cities.

It is a wholly owned subsidiary of Anew Climate, LLC founded in 2005, and is one of the largest environmental commodity companies in North America, with a focus on RNG marketing and environmental commodities. It serves RNG, low carbon fuels, electric vehicles, emissions, carbon, renewable fuel, and renewable energy credit markets.

Its clients include the Orange County Transportation Authority, SunLine Transit Agency and the Dallas Area Rapid Transit Authority.

Clean Energy Renewable Fuels, LLC dba in CA as Clean Energy Renewables (Clean Energy)

Clean Energy is headquartered in Newport Beach, California and has regional offices across North America.

Founded in 1996 and publicly traded since 2007, it is one of the largest providers of RNG for the transportation market in North America. Its clean fuel solutions include RNG, Compressed Natural Gas (CNG), Liquefied Natural Gas (LNG), renewable electricity, and hydrogen fuel.

Its clients include some of the largest fleets in the nation such as Republic Services, Amazon, UPS, the New York MTA, and LA Metro. It has supported LA Metro's CNG fleet operations since 2009. Currently, it supplies 11 CNG fueling stations, which include three designed and constructed facilities, as well as RNG to some Metro Divisions.

Shell Energy North America (US), LP (Shell)

Shell Energy is headquartered in Houston, Texas and has regional offices throughout the US and Canada. It is among North America's largest wholesale energy marketers and traders of natural gas, power, environmental, and risk management products. Its operating center in San Diego, California focuses on gas, power, carbon products and RNG services.

Founded in 1998, its parent company, Shell PLC, operates core business areas in Integrated Gas, Upstream and Downstream, and Renewables and Energy Solutions globally in over 70 countries. Its clients include the City of Los Angeles, the State of California, Waste Management Renewable Energy and LA Metro, where it has a current RNG supply contract.

Trillium USA Company, LLC (Trillium)

Trillium is headquartered in Houston, Texas and is one of the largest owners and operators of alternative fueling stations across the US, including CNG, RNG, hydrogen and electric vehicle charging.

Founded in 1964, it is a member of the Love's Family of Companies, which owns and operates hundreds of vehicle fuel stations across multiple states in the US. Collectively, these companies provide a wide range of fueling solutions for heavy-duty fleets. In addition to CNG and RNG, it offers biodiesel, renewable diesel, solar, and microgrids.

Its clients include Cities of Norwalk, Victory Valley, San Diego and Culver City, Orange County Transportation Authority, North County Transit District, and LA Metro, where it has a current RNG supply contract.

U.S. Venture, Inc. (U.S. Energy)

U.S Energy is headquartered in Appleton, Wisconsin and is one of the biggest providers in the US for the supply of renewable natural gas and renewable diesel, development of renewable natural gas projects, and generation and monetization of environmental credit markets such as the federal Renewable Fuel Standard (RFS) and California's Low Carbon Fuel Standard (LCFS).

Over the past 70 years, it has become vertically integrated throughout the fuel supply chain, and as a U.S. Venture company, a leading provider of transportation products and data-based insights, it has a huge portfolio of development projects where it is capturing methane at dairies, landfills, and wastewater treatment plants and converting it to RNG.

Its clients include SoCal Gas, RTC Las Vegas, MARTA (Atlanta, GA), Stanislaw Regional Transit Authority, Modesto, CA and the Salem Mass Area Transit, Salem, OR

Metro conducted individual discussions with Anew, Clean Energy, Shell, Trillium and U.S. Energy regarding the firms' technical proposals, clarifications, contract exceptions, and price assumptions. These discussions were held to give the proposers within the competitive range an opportunity to fully address and meet Metro's requirements.

Upon conclusion of the discussions, Metro issued a request for Best and Final Offers (BAFO) on January 27, 2026. BAFO proposals were distributed to the PET for technical scoring in accordance with the evaluation criteria established in the solicitation.

At the conclusion of the evaluation process, which was comprised of technical evaluations of submitted proposals, oral interviews and presentations, comprehensive discussions with all firms in the competitive range, and review of BAFOs, the proposal of SHELL ENERGY was determined to be the highest-ranked proposal.

The following is a summary of the PET scores:

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	**Shell Energy North America (US), LP**				
3	Qualifications, Capabilities & Experience	92.23	30.00%	27.67	
4	Proposed Project Organization & Staffing	92.20	15.00%	13.83	
5	Project Approach & Work Plan	88.33	15.00%	13.25	
6	Price Proposal	100.00	40.00%	40.00	
7	**Total**		**100.00%**	**94.75**	**1**
8	**Clean Energy Renewable Fuels, LLC dba in CA as Clean Energy Renewables**				
9	Qualifications, Capabilities & Experience	98.33	30.00%	29.50	
10	Proposed Project Organization & Staffing	98.87	15.00%	14.83	
11	Project Approach & Work Plan	98.33	15.00%	14.75	
12	Price Proposal	88.45	40.00%	35.38	
13	**Total**		**100.00%**	**94.46**	**2**
14	**U.S. Venture, Inc.**				
15	Qualifications, Capabilities & Experience	93.90	30.00%	28.17	
16	Proposed Project Organization & Staffing	92.20	15.00%	13.83	
17	Project Approach & Work Plan	90.00	15.00%	13.50	
18	Price Proposal	54.58	40.00%	21.83	
19	**Total**		**100.00%**	**77.33**	**3**
20	**Anew RNG, LLC**				
21	Qualifications, Capabilities & Experience	95.57	30.00%	28.67	
22	Proposed Project Organization & Staffing	96.67	15.00%	14.50	

23	Project Approach & Work Plan	93.33	15.00%	14.00	
24	Price Proposal	0.00	40.00%	0.00	
25	**Total**		**100.00%**	**57.17**	**4**
26	**Trillium USA Company, LLC**				
27	Qualifications, Capabilities & Experience	93.33	30.00%	28.00	
28	Proposed Project Organization & Staffing	91.13	15.00%	13.67	
29	Project Approach & Work Plan	85.87	15.00%	12.88	
30	Price Proposal	1.32	40.00%	0.53	
31	**Total**		**100.00%**	**55.08**	**5**

C. Cost/Price Analysis

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based upon the Independent Cost Estimate (ICE), price analysis, fact finding, and technical evaluation.

The Metro ICE was estimated using only the Commodity Price that Metro will pay to purchase the RNG fuel. It did not account for any monetization of environmental credits that Metro will receive as part of this agreement.

Shell's BAFO Commodity Price of $228,906,912.87 is approximately 1.5% lower than the Metro ICE of $232,407,019.

When applied, Shell's proposed BAFO LCFS and RINs Credits are likely to offset Shell's BAFO Commodity Price, and yielded a total of $44,486,197.41 in potential revenue to Metro.

Proposer	Metro ICE (Commodity Price Only)	Commodity Price	LCFS Credits	RINs Credits	Total* Proposed Price
Shell	**$232,407,019.00**	**$228,906,912.87**	**$59,473,556.68**	**$213,919,553.60**	**($44,486,197.41)**
Clean Energy		$197,452,629.63	$0.00	$229,199,521.68	($31,746,892.05)
U.S. Energy		$269,741,479.38	$72,001,840.18	$192,094,432.96	$5,645,206.24
Trillium		$269,741,479.38	$30,731,246.21	$174,628,207.04	$64,382,026.13
Anew		$297,182,308.08	$60,247,154.25	$171,081,071.56	$65,854,082.27

*Total Proposed Price (D) = (A) – (B) – (C):

(A) = Commodity Price: The price of the RNG that Metro will pay (Cost to Metro)

(B) & (C) = Environmental Credits: Incentives for using low-carbon fuel (Revenues to Metro)

- (B) = LCFS Credits (Low Carbon Fuel Standard): State-level (e.g., California) credits based on the carbon intensity of fuels
- (C) = RINs Credits (Renewable Identification Numbers): Federal EPA-regulated tracking codes for biofuels

D. Background on Recommended Contractor

Shell Energy is headquartered in Houston, Texas and has regional offices throughout the US and Canada. It is among North America's largest wholesale energy marketers and traders of natural gas, power, environmental, and risk management products. Its operating center in San Diego, CA focuses on gas, power, carbon products and RNG services.

Shell's clients include the City of Los Angeles, the State of California, Waste Management Renewable Energy and LA Metro, where it has a current RNG supply contract. Shell has performed satisfactorily on its contracts with Metro.