PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

BUS TIRE LEASING AND MAINTENANCE SERVICES / PS49398000

1.	**Contract Number**: PS49398000	
2.	**Recommended Vendor**: The Goodyear Tire and Rubber Company	
3.	**Type of Procurement (check one):** ☐ **IFB** ☐ **RFIQ** ☒ **RFP** ☐ **Non-Competitive** ☐ **Modification** ☐ **Task Order**	
4.	**Procurement Dates**:	
	A. Issued: October 12, 2023	
	B. Advertised/Publicized: October 14, 2023	
	C. Pre-Proposal Conference: October 19, 2023	
	D. Proposals Due: December 12, 2023	
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: January 18, 2024	
	F. Ethics Declaration Forms submitted to Ethics: December 13, 2023	
	G. Protest Period End Date: April 23, 2024	
5.	**Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded**: 5	**Proposals Received**: 2
6.	**Contract Administrator**: Shannon Thoene	**Telephone Number**: (213) 922-2790
7.	**Project Manager**: James Jimenez	**Telephone Number**: (213) 922-5870

A. Procurement Background

This Board Action is to approve the award of Contract No. PS49398000 for the lease and maintenance of tires for the Metro-operated bus fleet and servicing of non-revenue vehicle tires. Board approval of contract award is subject to resolution of any properly submitted protest, if any.

On October 12, 2023, Request for Proposals (RFP) No. PS49398 was issued as a competitive procurement in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is firm fixed unit rate. This RFP was issued with a 5% Race Conscious Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) goal.

Four amendments were issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on October 18, 2023, modified the pre-proposal conference meeting time.
- Amendment No. 2, issued on November 13, 2023, revised the RFP submittal requirements to include supporting pricing documentation, modified the Schedule of Quantities and Prices to provide mileage and unit rates, amended the scope of services to clarify the equipment needed for tire inspections, tread depth requirements for rear tires and approvals required for overtime work.
- Amendment No. 3, issued on November 16, 2023, extended the proposal due date.
- Amendment No. 4, issued on December 5, 2023, extended the proposal due date.

A total of 5 firms downloaded the RFP and were included on the planholders' list. A hybrid pre-proposal conference was held on October 19, 2023, and participants were given the opportunity to attend the meeting in person or remotely. The pre-proposal conference was attended by 9 participants, representing 2 firms. A worksite visit was also conducted on the same day and was attended by 2 participants representing 1 firm. There were 85 questions received, and responses were released prior to the proposal due date.

A total of two proposals were received by the due date of December 12, 2023, and are listed below in alphabetical order:

1. Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations, LLC
2. The Goodyear Tire and Rubber Company

B. Evaluation of Proposals

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro's Environmental Compliance & Service and Maintenance Operations was convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received.

Proposers were advised of an approved equal for a heavy-duty tire changer and a wheel balancer through the Q&A issued on November 13, 2023. Subsequently, staff formalized the Metro approved equal.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria:

Phase I - Pass/Fail Minimum Qualification Equipment Requirements: This is a pass/fail criteria. To be responsive to the RFP minimum qualification requirements, proposers must provide a written statement that they will provide the required new equipment: Coats Model HIT6000 Heavy Duty Tire Changer or Hunter TCX635HD Heavy Duty Tire Changer, Coats Model 6450 Heavy Duty Wheel Balancer or John Bean 9800 Heavy Duty Wheel Balancer, Portable Air Compressor, Hand Tools, Torque Wrench, and Impact Wrench and 2022 model year or newer service truck within two months of contract start date.

Phase II – Weighted Evaluation: Proposers that meet the Phase I Minimum Qualification Requirements are further evaluated based on the following criteria and weights:

- Qualifications of the Prime Contractor and the Team — 25 Points
- Qualification and Capabilities of Key Personnel — 11 Points
- Understanding of the Scope of Services and Management Plan/Approach — 40 Points
- DBE Contracting Outreach and Mentor Protege Approach — 4 Points
- Cost Proposal — 20 Points

The evaluation criteria are appropriate and consistent with criteria developed for similar types of procurements. Several factors were considered in developing these weights, giving the greatest importance to the understanding of the scope of services and management plan/approach.

During the period of December 14, 2023 to December 27, 2023, the PET independently evaluated and scored the technical proposals. The PET deemed both proposals to be responsive to the Phase I - Pass/Fail Minimum Qualification Equipment Requirements and continued to evaluate the proposals based on the Phase II – Weighted Evaluation.

On December 29, 2023, the PET completed its evaluation and determined The Goodyear Tire and Rubber Company to be the highest ranked proposer.

Qualifications Summary of Firms within the Competitive Range:

Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations, LLC

Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations, LLC is the tire division of Bridgestone America's, Inc., the North American subsidiary of Bridgestone Corporation.

The Mileage Sales Group of Bridgestone America's Tire Operations, LLC, is headquartered in Nashville, TN, and has been in the tire business for over 90 years. It offers quality tire products to customers both in the public transit and privately operated bus industries. Existing transit agency clients include the Metropolitan Transit Authority of Harris County, Texas, the Municipality of Metropolitan Seattle, Sacramento Regional Transit District, Omnitrans, and the Orange County Transportation Authority.

The Goodyear Tire and Rubber Company

The Goodyear Tire & Rubber Company (Goodyear) has been in the tire and rubber business since 1898. It has been leasing tires for most of the company's 125 years of existence, which includes almost 80 different transit system locations in North America. It has provided tire leasing and/or maintenance services to numerous transit agencies in the United States and Canada. Clients include Chicago Transit Authority, New York City Transit/MTA Bus Company, Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority, City of Edmonton, and Calgary Transit.

The following is a summary of the PET scores:

1	Firm	Average Score	Factor Weight	Weighted Average Score	Rank
2	**The Goodyear Tire and Rubber Company**				
3	Qualifications of the Prime Contractor and the Team	93.33	25.00%	23.33	

4	Qualification and Capabilities of Key Personnel	85.56	11.00%	9.41	
5	Understanding of the Scope of Services and Management Plan/Approach	87.41	40.00%	34.96	
6	DBE Contracting Outreach and Mentor Protégé Approach	75.00	4.00%	3.00	
7	Cost Proposal	100.00	20.00%	20.00	
8	**Total**		**100.00%**	**90.70**	**1**
9	**Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations, LLC**				
10	Qualifications of the Prime Contractor and the Team	81.33	25.00%	20.33	
11	Qualification and Capabilities of Key Personnel	67.78	11.00%	7.46	
12	Understanding of the Scope of Services and Management Plan/Approach	62.96	40.00%	25.19	
13	DBE Contracting Outreach and Mentor Protégé Approach	75.00	4.00%	3.00	
14	Cost Proposal	97.60	20.00%	19.52	
15	**Total**		**100.00%**	**75.50**	**2**

C. Price Analysis

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based on the Independent Cost Estimate (ICE), price analysis, technical evaluation, fact-finding, and negotiations. Metro staff successfully negotiated a cost savings of $1,276,452.

	Proposer Name	Proposal Amount	Metro ICE	Recommended/ Negotiated Amount
1.	The Goodyear Tire and Rubber Company	$50,272,968	$54,561,000	$48,996,516
2.	Bridgestone Americas Tire Operations, LLC	$51,500,000		

The variance between the ICE and the negotiated amount is primarily due to lower tire lease mileage and escalation rates proposed by Goodyear.

D. Background on Recommended Contractor

The Goodyear Tire and Rubber Company (Goodyear) is an American multinational tire manufacturer headquartered in Akron, Ohio and has been in business for over 125 years. It develops, manufactures, and distributes a wide range of tires for automobiles, trucks, buses, aircraft, motorcycles, earth moving and mining equipment, farm implements, industrial equipment and various other applications.

Goodyear has been providing bus tire leasing and maintenance services to Metro for over 25 years and performance has been satisfactory.

The Goodyear team includes three DBE-certified subcontractors providing tire disposal services, aluminum wheel polishing, and supplying uniform and safety apparel.