

**Board Report**

File #: 2017-0253, **File Type:** Contract**Agenda Number:** 31.

**SYSTEM SAFETY, SECURITY AND OPERATIONS COMMITTEE
SEPTEMBER 21, 2017****SUBJECT: PARKING ENFORCEMENT SERVICES TRANSITION****ACTION: APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS****RECOMMENDATION**

CONSIDER:

- A. AUTHORIZING the transition of parking enforcement services from Metro Transit Security and the Los Angeles Sheriff's Department (LASD) to the Parking Management unit; and
- B. AUTHORIZING the Chief Executive Officer to execute a five-year, firm fixed price Contract No. PS37647008 to SP+ Municipal Services, for parking enforcement services at Metro parking facilities serving Metro's transit system in the amount of \$4,599,446, subject to resolution of protest(s), if any.

ISSUE

Improving parking enforcement is part of Parking Management's broader set of efforts to maximize transit parking and improve customer service. In conjunction with the Parking Management Pilot Program ("Pilot Program"), consistent parking enforcement is needed to assist in managing parking demand in Metro's transit lots. Addressing non-transit use of spaces, compliance with parking regulations and proper use of facilities maximizes the space available to transit riders. Parking Management staff worked with Transit Security to develop a plan to transition parking enforcement to the Parking Management unit and has procured a contract for parking enforcement services at all Metro-operated parking facilities. The System Security and Law Enforcement Division is working together with Labor Relations to ensure compliance with the collective bargaining agreement, and the proposed actions assure that Transit Security would still perform key aspects of parking enforcement, as permitted by state law. Personnel of the contracted service and Transit Security will both be members of the Teamsters Local 911.

Staff is requesting authorization for the transition of duties of parking enforcement to Parking Management. If approved, the Parking Enforcement Program will be fully operational by winter 2018. Parking citations processing and adjudication will continue to be handled by Transit Court.

DISCUSSION**Background**

Parking enforcement is currently handled by Metro Transit Security and contracted law enforcement, whose primary focus is to provide safety and security at Metro properties. This expansive purview limits their ability to properly enforce parking regulations along Metro’s expanding transit system.

Transition and outsourcing of parking enforcement to non-sworn officers was introduced to the Board as one of Metro’s RAM (“Risk Allocation Matrix”) initiatives in January 2016. The initiative requires Board approval for its implementation.

Metro currently parks approximately four million cars a year at 87 parking facilities throughout Los Angeles County and issues approximately 5,000 parking citations per year. As the transit system continues to expand, so will the need to administer a more proactive and focused parking enforcement management program.

Parking Enforcement Transition

As part of the Supportive Transit Parking Program (“STPP”) Master Plan study, Walker Parking Consultants (“Walker”) conducted a parking enforcement analysis of Metro-operated parking facilities. The analysis indicates that the parking citation issuance at Metro parking facilities is lower than other comparable transit agencies. Metro issued approximately 5,000 citations (0.0013% of total cars parked) which is 90% fewer citations per space per year compared to two other sizable transit agencies. See the following table.

Comparison of Citation Issuance to Other Transit Agencies

Agency	Number of Spaces	Parking Citations	Citations/Space/Year	Citation Issuance Relative to Metro
Transit Agency 1	48,000	98,700	2.06	8.5
Transit Agency 2	50,400	132,000	2.62	10.8
Metro	21,200	5,140	0.24	n/a

Source: Walker Parking Consultants, 2016

Therefore, Walker recommends that Metro utilize non-sworn officers and new innovative technology solutions to improve the performance of parking enforcement while also allowing Metro Security and contracted law enforcement to primarily focus on safety and security.

Transitioning the parking enforcement duties to the Parking Management unit will allow Metro Transit Security and contracted law enforcement to reallocate their resources to further focus on safety and security along Metro transit system. This move will also enhance safety at Metro parking facilities with additional personnel on site consistently and with dedicated staff resources.

Cost Analysis

Based on a recent coordinated parking enforcement review, four Los Angeles Sheriff Department (“LASD”) officers along with three Metro support staff issued 35 parking citations in a six-hour time period. This effort covered three Metro parking facilities along the Expo Line. The labor cost of LASD

officers was over \$3,000, far in excess of the citation revenue. In contrast, by utilizing non-sworn officers with the proposed new technology solutions for the same enforcement effort, the total labor cost for issuing 35 citations at three locations would be \$40.00, as shown on the following table.

Coordinated Enforcement

	Labor Hour Billable Rate	Labor Cost	Per Citation Labor Cost
MTA Security	\$ 64.04	\$ 1,536.96	\$ 43.91
LASD	\$ 140.00	\$ 3,360.00	\$ 96.00
Parking Enforcement	\$ 20.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 1.14

- *LASD/MTA: 4 officers for 6 hour
- *Proposed: 1 non-sworn officer @
- *Hourly bill rate includes all labor

Through the new parking enforcement program, the estimated labor cost will result in approximately \$1.15 per citation.

Based on a comparable analysis by Walker, an estimated 25,000 parking citations would be expected to be issued per year. However, staff is planning to take a softer and customer service based approach on the parking citations issuance during the transition year, and only projects 15,000 parking citations to be issued. The average parking citation per Metro’s Parking Ordinance and Fee Resolution is \$58.00 which is expected to generate approximately \$870,000 in gross parking citation revenue during year one.

A parking enforcement transition will not only eliminate jurisdiction confusion among Metro Transit Security, LASD and CHP officers, it will also consolidate parking enforcement, eliminating the cost of reimbursement to other agencies.

Parking Enforcement Program

To move forward with the transition, Parking Management held several interdepartmental meetings leading to an agreement by Metro Transit Security Management, Countywide Planning, Transit Court and Parking Management to transition parking enforcement responsibilities to the Parking Management unit. In preparation for this transition, Parking Management has assigned a parking enforcement manager to oversee this parking enforcement contract and all parking enforcement-related duties.

The Parking Enforcement Program objectives are to:

- Facilitate availability of parking spaces throughout the system to transit users.
- Ensure compliance with Metro’s Parking Ordinance at Metro parking facilities.
- Support the Pilot Program.
- Increase safety and security with consistent presence.

- Identify and report maintenance needs.
- Improve overall customer satisfaction with the transit system.

Parking Management has developed a parking enforcement transition program centered on contracting with a parking enforcement contractor. The contractor's services will focus on enforcing Metro's Parking Ordinance and Parking Fee Resolution (Metro Administration Code Chapter 8), adopted by the Board in September 2015, at all Metro-operated parking facilities. Features of the enforcement program include:

- *Innovative technology to support the Parking Management Pilot Program ("Pilot Program") and enforce parking regulations.* Parking enforcement vehicles will be equipped with mobile license plate recognition (LPR) cameras which are integrated with all parking payment systems available to Metro customers.
- *Reduction of enforcement operating costs by appropriately utilizing non-sworn peace officers and providing dedicated enforcement resources.*
- *Proactive approach driven by compliance data.*
- *Support for the Pilot Program and the overall STPP Master Plan findings and recommendations.*
- *Transit Court:* All citation administration and adjudication will remain with Transit Court.

Labor Relations

Labor Relations Staff is discussing the initiative with Teamster Local 911 Transit Security Management to ensure the compliance with the collective bargaining agreement. In accordance with the collective bargaining agreement, Transit Security will continue to perform key aspects of parking enforcement, only as permitted by state law, along with the contracted service provider. Metro committed to include specific language in the service contract to illustrate each party's duties. The service contractor will also be required to utilize Teamster Local 911 members to perform contracted services.

Parking Enforcement Implementation Plan

Metro Parking Management and Transit Court have developed the following inter-departmental responsibilities after the transition:

Metro Parking Management Unit Responsibilities:

- Implement new parking enforcement protocol, procedures and schedule for the new parking enforcement program.
- Enforce Metro's Parking Ordinance and Parking Fee Resolution.
- Patrol all Metro-managed parking facilities.
- Report all irregular activities to Transit Court for coordination with law enforcement and/or Metro Transit Security.
- Provide adequate materials for hearing and appeal process to Transit Court.
- Upload via the Transit ECitation Software Application all parking citation data in a citation database of Transit Court.

- Install and purchase all parking enforcement equipment and innovative solutions.
- Procure, monitor performance, audit and administer the parking enforcement contractor contract.

Metro Transit Security Responsibilities

- Enforce Metro Parking Ordinance violations not related to payment.
- Enforce all Metro adopted Administrative Codes.

LASD/LAPD/LBPD Responsibilities:

- Enforce all California Vehicle Code violations.
- Enforce ADA placard and license plate compliance and parking violations.
- Impound and towing of vehicles according to regulation.

Metro Transit Court Responsibilities:

- Process and collect parking citation fees.
- Conduct initial review of citations.
- Conduct an Administrative Hearing.
- Audit and account for the parking citation revenue collection.
- Recruit the independent reviewer and/or hearing officers and pay the costs for the review and hearing officers.
- Retention and safekeeping of the records of the appeal hearings.
- Prepare case package for citations which require further appeal process to the Superior Court and represent the Agency on appeals at Superior Court.
- Respond to customer-related citation complaints.

The Selected Contractor

Major contract tasks include:

- Enforcement of Metro Parking Ordinance and Fee Resolution.
- Report irregular activities to Metro.
- Report maintenance needs at Metro parking facilities.
- Develop a parking enforcement database available to Metro at all times.

The parking enforcement contractor will utilize the latest technology in the parking industry. Some of the parking equipment provided by the parking enforcement contractor include: vehicles, printers, cameras, parking citation issuance handhelds and mobile license plate recognition system. The parking enforcement contractor will also be able to integrate its system with Metro's current parking programs and Transit Court citation issuance applications. All equipment will be housed and maintained by the contractor.

DETERMINATION OF SAFETY IMPACT

Once implemented, the parking enforcement contractor's services will improve the safety of patrons

at Metro transit parking facilities. Parking enforcement officers will increase vigilance and a sense of safety and security at Metro parking facilities. The regular visibility of parking enforcement officers will help reduce speeding and deter illegal and unsafe activities on Metro property. Parking enforcement officers will be able to address situations and notify Transit Security more proactively. Contracted law enforcement and Metro's Transit Security will be able to reallocate their time and resources to further focus on safety and security of the transit system.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Once the program is implemented at all 87 Metro stations' parking facilities, staff anticipates the gross parking citation revenue estimated at \$6,670,000 over five years. The estimated operating cost for the duration of the five year contract is \$4,599,446. Based on an average parking citation cost of \$58.00 and 15,000 parking citations during FY18, the program will generate \$870,000 in year one for a total recovery cost of 81% of the parking enforcement contract in the current fiscal year.

Assuming parking citation issuance at Metro parking facilities reaches the anticipated 25,000 parking citations annually from year two to year five, the program will recover 100% of the parking enforcement services contract value. The remaining balance will also help to recover administration and citation processing costs by Transit Court and contribute to the RAM Initiative. The program will also eliminate the current operating losses by significantly reducing labor cost.

Impact to Budget

The contract cost is included in Parking Management unit's annual operating budget in Cost Center 3046 in FY18 under Account 50316, Project 308001 and Task 01.01 for Professional and Technical Services. This motion does not require any budget amendment. Since this is a multi-year contract, the cost center manager and Chief Planning Officer will be responsible for budgeting for future costs in future years.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

The Board may choose to maintain status quo and not authorize moving forward with the transition and award of the contract to outsource parking enforcement service. This is not recommended as Metro would then continue to utilize law enforcement and transit security resources for this task and operate without ample level of parking enforcement. The labor cost of continuing to utilize law enforcement and transit security officers for this task while fully enforcing rules and regulations will also continue to remain high with low efficiency. Not moving forward with this contract would be counter to Metro's RAM and continue operation without innovative solutions. This program is a large component of the Pilot Program and the STPP Master Plan and the examination of a long-term parking management strategy to manage Metro's parking resources.

NEXT STEPS

Upon approval by the Board, staff will execute Contract No. PS37647008 with SP+ Municipal Services in the amount of \$4,599,446 to implement the Parking Enforcement Program.

Successful transition of parking enforcement responsibilities to the Parking Management unit is expected to be completed by winter of 2018.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment A - Procurement Summary
Attachment B - DEOD Summary

Prepared by: Frank Ching, Senior Director, Countywide Planning & Development, (213) 922-3033
Cal Hollis, SEO, Countywide Planning & Development, (213) 922-7319

Reviewed by: Therese W. McMillan, Chief Planning Officer, (213) 922-7077
Alex Wiggins, Chief System Security & Law Enforcement Officer, (213) 922-7415
Debra Avila, Chief Vendor/Contract Management Officer, (213) 418-3051



Phillip A. Washington
Chief Executive Officer